

## **An Analysis of Social Studies Textbooks in Turkey: From National Citizenship to Global Citizenship<sup>1</sup>**

**Arife Figen Ersoy\***

Anadolu University, Turkey

### **Abstract**

The purpose of this study is to examine Social Studies textbooks in terms of national and global citizenship. The research was carried out using qualitative research methodologies. Interpretive thematic analysis was used to examine the social studies textbooks from 4<sup>th</sup> grade through 8<sup>th</sup> grade. The analyses showed that the Social Studies textbooks put more emphasis on national citizenship but they inadequately deal with global information so as to create global sensitivity. The Social Studies textbooks do not adequately discuss economic, social, political systems, cultural differences and problems in both national and global scales. The Social Studies textbooks tend to be guided by nationalist and republican policies while they offer limited content and activities for students to improve their competences for political literacy, participation, critical thinking, respect for diversity and conflict resolution.

**Keywords:** Citizenship education, social studies, textbook, curriculum, global citizenship.

\* Arife Figen Ersoy is associate professor of Social Studies Education in Anadolu University, Turkey.

<sup>1</sup> This paper was presented at the European Conference on Educational Research-(ECER 2010) in Helsinki, Finland (25-27 August 2010).

## Introduction

In recent years, with the increase of transnational and cross-cultural interaction, more and more people are beginning to adopt an understanding of living in multicultural societies, global economy and global citizenship (Banks, 2004; Brodie, 2004; Davies, 2006; NCSS, 1982). A global citizen should have some qualities like awareness of a wider world and a sense of a role as a citizen of the world, respect for values and diversity, understanding of how the world functions economically, politically, socially, culturally, technologically and environmentally, conception of social justice, motivation to participate in and contribute to the community at both local and global levels, willingness to act to make the world more equitable and sustainable place, and responsibility for their action (Marshall, 2009; Oxfam, 1997; Quillen, 1944). In this regard, countries aim to have their citizens acquire global citizenship qualifications in recent years. Global citizenship education aims to educate children and young people with the understanding, skills, and values that help them become more 'globally minded' (Marshall, 2009). According to NCSS (1982), the purpose of global education is to cultivate in young people a perspective of the world, which highlights the interconnectedness among cultures, species, and the planet. Banks (2004) states that in order to create an effective citizenship curriculum that will educate students to be active citizens in their cultural communities, nation-states and in the world community, the curriculum should provide opportunities to reflect the complex national identities within the growing diversity of the world. In elementary education, Social Studies course plays an important role in global citizenship education. The acquisitions covered in Social Studies are consistent with the competences of global citizenship (Evans, 1987; NCSS, 1994).

Turkey is a country in an ongoing process of European Union full membership. For this reason, since the early 2000s, Turkey has adopted the objective of educating its citizens to be open for communication and integration with the world as a policy. The purpose of citizenship education, in Turkey context, is to gain the competences of the European and global citizenship as a part of supra-national citizenship in addition to national citizenship competencies. In Turkey, Social Studies course is considered as the main course in citizenship education. Therefore, it is important to critically analyze social studies textbooks in terms of global citizenship. This study investigates how concepts of national and global citizenship are covered in Social Studies textbooks (from 4<sup>th</sup> grade to 8<sup>th</sup> grade), which were revised within the framework of active and democratic citizenship principles. Analyzing textbooks of Social Studies provides significant information about the citizenship qualities desired in Turkey. The findings from this study are expected to show teachers the problems in textbooks regarding the implementation of national and global citizenship, to help textbook authors eliminate these problems and to contribute to the formation of educational policies for global citizenship.

## Citizenship and Textbooks

Although it is essential to use various resources in citizenship education, in many countries, teachers still use textbooks as the primary source and shape their practices based on them (Lebrun, *et al.*, 2002; Ramonowski, 1995). Studies that analyze textbooks in terms of citizenship, democracy and human rights (Aslan, & Karaman-Kepenekçi, 2008; Brindle & Arnot, 1999; Firer, 1998; Collado & Atxurra, 2006; Kepenekçi, 2005; Meyer, Bromley & Ramirez, 2010; Romanowski 1994; Moss, 2010; Suárez, 2008; Tooth, 2008) identity and citizenship (Lee, 2011; Wang, 1999) and gender roles (Brindle & Arnot, 1999; Naseem, 2006) report that many contents and messages affect the formation of citizen perception and competences.

Several cross-national and longitudinal studies found that textbooks are formed according to countries' politics and culture (Lebrun, *et al.* 2002; Meyer, Bromley & Ramirez,

2010; Tooth, 2008). The ethnocentric and national educational policies of many countries are reflected in their curriculums and textbooks (Çayır, 2009; Dong-Bae, 2010). Apple (2004, cited in Su, 2007) states that curriculums and textbooks act as agents for reflecting a state's citizenship policies and the values and principles of a political power. Crawford (2004) claims that, by supporting the dominant cultural, political and ideological views of the society, textbooks contribute to the formation of a culturally homogeneous society and strengthening and spread of the dominant cultures. Also, some cultures impose an individual notion of citizenship in their textbooks while some other put more emphasis on communitarian citizenship (Imada, 2010; Suárez, 2008; Terra, 2008). These studies suggest that particularly the concept of citizenship in textbooks play a key role in shaping students' perception of citizenship.

### **Citizenship in textbooks in Turkey**

In Turkey, transmission of the understanding of citizenship in textbooks has been shaped in line with politics. A policy of national and republican citizenship has been adopted since the establishment of the Republic of Turkey (1923) until the 2000s. Efforts to raise loyal national citizens were carried out along with modernizations efforts (Kadıoğlu, 2007; Üstel, 2004). During the single-party period (1923-1950), nationalism came to the fore as a result of the efforts to create a nation state the origins of citizenship were determined as national history, national language and national culture and devotion, diligence, submissiveness and good morals were emphasized as properties of a citizen. On the other hand, during the multi-party period (1950-1980), the origin of citizenship transformed into commonality with an emphasis on common culture, common land, common language and common culture and 'a citizen' was defined as an obedient, respecting and responsible individual. After 1980, textbooks included the Turkish-Islamic synthesis with emphasis on the unity of religion. In the 2000s, the notion of citizenship evolved into a collective identity within the framework of "humanistic awareness" (Gürses & Pazarcı, 2010). Research conducted in Turkey report that textbooks define good citizens as responsible and loyal individuals who can sacrifice anything for the sake of national solidarity and unity, care about the society more than themselves and act accordingly (Kılıç-Oğuz, 2007; Üstel, 2004). Moreover, obedience was integrated into textbooks by blessing authority and textbooks highlighted the older against the younger, men against women, the state against the citizen and duties against rights by trivializing the individual (Gemalmaz, 2003). Until the 2000s Social Studies textbooks tended to deal more with national issues, national history, national geography and national economy whereas transnational issues were limited to the Renaissance and Reformation, history of Europe, neighboring countries of Turkey and Central Asian Turkish states. The primary objective during this period was to educate students in accordance with national values with a textbook-driven and teacher-centered education.

Turkey's European Union [EU] accession process was a turning point in its global citizenship education. Starting in the 2000s, the national and collectivist citizenship education policy in Turkey turned into an efficient and democratic citizenship education. In this respect, the Turkish Ministry of National Education [MoNE] developed new curriculum in 2004 based on the norms, aims and educational concepts of EU (MoNE, 2001). In the scope of the revisions, global citizenship has found its place in Social Studies textbooks in terms of increasing awareness of concept of citizenship beyond national framework and developing recognition for global citizenship. The revised Social Studies curriculum covered a learning domain "Global connections" and used the statement '*to care about adopting universal values by centering on national identity*' (MoNE, 2005a, p.51). Analyzes on the revised textbooks indicated that the new textbooks regarded an enlightened citizen as a responsible individual who questions local and global issues (Gürses & Pazarcı, 2010) and the 6<sup>th</sup> and 8<sup>th</sup> grades covered more of global values (Özkan, 2010). However, Çayır (2009) claims that the strong nationalist approach, which existed in Turkey for many years, still continues to be

emphasized in the new textbooks through national identity and students are not given a multicultural perspective. Also, Özkan (2010) states that values such as unity, loyalty, patronage, obedience and solidarity are still prevalent in the revised Social Studies textbooks. On the other hand, although these two studies report that a national concept of citizenship continues to exist in the textbooks, they do not give a detailed description of the missing aspects in the textbooks in terms of global citizenship.

## **Methodology**

### ***Sample***

In Turkey, which has a centralized education system, textbooks are designed by a commission of field experts and teachers or by private publishers. After MoNE's approval, textbooks are distributed free to students. The textbooks to be analyzed in this study were selected by purposive sampling. The study analyzed a total of 5 textbooks prepared by MoNE: Social Studies (from 4<sup>th</sup> grade to 7<sup>th</sup> grade) and History of the Republic of Turkey and Kemalism (8<sup>th</sup> grade). The reason for choosing textbooks prepared by the Ministry was the idea that the state would reflect the citizenship policy better than private publishers. The study specifically tried to determine the national and global citizenship perspective of the textbooks prepared and distributed by MoNE (the textbooks analyzed are given in the appendix).

### ***Data Analysis***

The textbooks analyzed in this study were considered as the official document of the Ministry of National Education and examined in detail. In qualitative research, documents can be used as a stand-alone data source or they can also be used with other data for diversity (Bowen, 2009). In this study, the textbooks were investigated with interpretative thematic analysis. Although thematic analysis is based on theoretical perspective, it allows the researcher to be flexible and creative in the re-creation of themes and offers rich data (Braun & Clarke, 2006).

In this study, defining themes of the data obtained through the analysis of textbooks was based on studies that evaluate textbooks in terms of active and democratic citizenship, European citizenship and world citizenship education (Firer, 1998; Kepenekçi, 2005; La Caba Collado & Rafael, 2006; Tooth, 2008) and theoretical studies (Keating, 2009a; Keating, Ortloff & Philippou 2009; Oxfam; 1997). In addition, the competences of national and global citizenship in the Social Studies curriculum and textbooks, global citizenship (Oxfam, 1997) and the European Reference Framework of Key competences for Lifelong Learning [EC] (2007) qualifications were taken into consideration. The textbooks were analyzed and interpreted under the following themes:

- 1) Politically knowledgeable citizen: Governance, human rights, social and political issues.
- 2) Intellectual citizen: Critical thinking and problem solving.
- 3) Active and Participating Citizen: Political and social participation.
- 4) Virtuous Citizen: Identity, commitment and belonging, responsibility, respect and tolerance, solidarity, conflict resolution and peace.

The Social Studies textbooks in 4<sup>th</sup>-8<sup>th</sup> grades were analyzed within the scope of the themes identified and in terms of the basic competencies of national and global citizenship. Thus, the basic competencies of national and global citizenship in the Social Studies textbooks were analyzed comparatively in developmental terms. The findings are described on the matrix in Table 1 and supported by direct quotations from the textbooks.

Table 1. The issues in Social Studies textbooks about the dimensions of the national and global citizenship

| Theme                                 | Grade | <i>National citizenship</i>   | <i>Global citizenship</i>   |
|---------------------------------------|-------|---|---|
| Governance and power                  | 4-5   | Governance structure (local and national government departments and directors, tasks)<br>Democracy (elections, the people's sovereignty and independence), TR State properties (Atatürk's principles)<br>Rules and the law (class contract, constitutions)  | Governance in various countries around the world<br>History of democracy in the world (Athens, the Magna Carta, invention of the printing press, the Age of Enlightenment, French Revolution, declaration of the Ottoman constitutional monarchy, Grand National Assembly of Turkey, World War II, the fall of the Berlin Wall) |
|                                       | 6-8   | Relations of the Republic of Turkey (economic and political), Turkish governance forms (monarchy, oligarchy, theocracy and republic), governance and democracy in Turkish states, the national governance (electoral, constitutional, legislative, executive and judicial process)<br>State information (historical events, and Atatürk's principles and revolutions) | Recent political events (the breakup of the USSR, the cold war period, the Gulf wars)<br>Organizations which Turkey belongs to (European Union, the Black Sea Economic Cooperation, NATO, UN)   |
| Human rights                          | 4-5   | Special rights (Consumer rights, children's rights, women's rights, democracy and human rights relationship in the Ottoman Empire and the Republic of Turkey)   | Development of human rights (the laws of Hammurabi, the Magna Carta, Ottoman Law, Universal Declaration of Human Rights, the European human rights conventions)   |
|                                       | 6-8   | Citizenship rights (The right to elect and to be elected-at school and in country)<br>Human rights (Personal rights, social and economic rights and political rights)<br>Special rights (women's rights - social and political)   | Environmental rights (1982 Rio Declaration on Environment and Development, Summit of the Caspian Sea and Black Sea ecology)<br>Special rights (women's right to elect and to be elected)  |
| Social issues and problems            | 4-5   | Environment (earthquakes, environmental pollution)  | Environment (earthquakes, global warming, species extinction, deforestation)  |
|                                       | 6-8   | Environmental problems (Southeastern Anatolia Project forest fires, erosion), Economic issues (energy sources-boron metal, pirate publishing, internal migration, brain drain<br>Political (activities of reactionary, separatist activities, missionary, the Armenian issue)   | Environmental issues (forest fires, earthquakes, global warming)<br>Economic (insufficiency of energy resources)<br>Health problems (bird flu, AIDS), migration (political, economic)   |
| Critical thinking and problem solving | 4-5   | Critical thinking (school committee, media broadcasting)  |   |
|                                       | 6-8   | Problem solving (boron, unplanned urbanization, environmental issues, organ donation, political problems)   | Problem solving (global warming)  |
| Participation                         | 4-5   | Participation in decision-making (in the family)<br>Non-governmental organizations (health, environment, education)<br>Petition, the public   |   |
|                                       | 6-8   | Protest, petition, the public,<br>Participation in social activities at school  | The international community (nuclear energy)<br>Protest (Hon Kong human rights)   |
| Commitment and belonging              | 4-5   | National citizenship and commitment (the national history, Turkish War of Independence, Foundation of the Republic of Turkey, the opening of the Grand National Assembly of Turkey, flag, national anthem, the national language, national sovereignty)   | Geographic (Geographical position, climate, crops of some countries,)<br>Economic (International economic trade, the world's agriculture, trade and service sectors)  |
|                                       | 6-8   | Historical and cultural commitment (History of Anatolia and Anatolian civilization, Turkish history)  | Intercultural relations in history (economic and cultural)<br>Turkish citizens living abroad  |
| Responsibility                        | 4-5   | Immediate social environment (family, friends, student clubs at school, social events and group work)   |   |
|                                       | 6-8   | State (military service, paying tax, elections, obeying laws, protecting the country), Environmental pollution  | Environmental issues (individual responsibility), Natural disasters,  |
| Respect and tolerance                 | 4-5   | Individual (respect for the physical and emotional characteristics of individual), Cultural (respect for crafts, songs, architect, meals, traditional ceremonies, historic buildings)   | Different cultures in the world (climate types and the consequent different styles of life, food, clothing, ceremonies)<br>Common culture and heritage (the seven wonders of the world)   |
|                                       | 6-8   | Religious tolerance<br>History of tolerance (Ottoman Empire)  | Different cultures around the world<br>Interaction between cultures in history (Ottoman-European)   |
| Solidarity and cooperation            | 4-5   | Solidarity and cooperation (in family and community life)<br>National solidarity  | Natural disasters, solidarity   |
|                                       | 6-8   | National solidarity (Turkish War of Independence)   | Natural disasters (earthquakes), health and medical (infectious diseases and AIDS), cultural (arts, sports and scientific studies)  |
| Conflict resolution and peace         | 4-5   | Friendship relationships  | International organizations (BM, NATO)  |
|                                       | 6-8   |   |   |

## Findings

### *Politically knowledgeable citizen: From government, and human rights to social and political issues*

The Social Studies textbooks analyzed deal with local and national governance processes, the history of democracy in Turkish states and in the world, and the establishment and revolutions of the Republic of Turkey. Among the processes of national government, the legislative process is emphasized more than the executive and judicial processes. Lack of sufficient information and examples about how the judicial process functions causes the judiciary and legal system to remain behind the legislation. The 'global connections' learning domain in the Social Studies textbooks often deals with the forms of governance of the states with which Turkey has economic relations. Only the eighth-grade textbook partly mention the collapse of the Soviet Union and the newly established states in the Balkans and Central Asia and the world's changing political structure. Although Turkey's accession process to EU, UN and NATO is explained historically, the political structure, management and operation process of EU, UN and NATO are not explained. Therefore, the Social Studies textbooks do not provide sufficient information about the functioning and activities of the international decision-making, judiciary and military forces in the world.

Consumer rights, women's rights and children's rights, personal, social and political rights are discussed in the Social Studies textbooks, but there is no mention of ethnic and religious minorities and their rights. The textbooks deal with human rights and emphasize that the rights are secured by the Constitution. In addition, human rights are described along with constitutional limitations. To illustrate, textbooks state that freedom of press and expression can be used in places allowed by the governor and mention the circumstances in the constitution in which freedom of residence and travel can be taken away. The textbooks emphasize that human rights are universal. For instance, they explain that Universal Children's Day is celebrated all over the world and numerous states have contributed to the process of development of human rights since the ancient times and they mention European human rights convention. While dealing with human rights, however, they do not give examples about human rights violations. Also, they do not explain which national and global institutions can be asked for help in case of violation of human rights. In addition, while the textbooks highlight citizens' equality before the law, they focus on social equality and justice and give the message that socio-economic disparities are just natural. The concept of social justice is indirectly associated with cooperation and solidarity at both national and global levels. Gender equality is emphasized more on the basis of laws and rights. The textbooks give a historical account of the rights granted to women in Turkey and state that women in Turkey were granted the right to elect and be elected in 1934, before many other countries. However, they do not mention the current situation, exclude the problems experienced by women, don't discuss social inequality. This situation reflects the impression in the textbooks that women do not have any problems and are socially equal as men.

The Social Studies textbooks deal with the problem of global warming most at national and global scale. At the national level, global warming is followed by other environmental problems such as environmental pollution, natural disasters, and erosion. The textbooks briefly mention economic problems such as sources of energy, mines, pirate publishing, internal migration, the brain drain. Only the eighth-grade textbook discusses reactionary and ethnic separatist activities, missionary, political issues, such as the Armenian issue. The textbooks do not promote thinking on political problems, questioning, or research activities. National and global issues, most of which are considered to be controversial issues, are discussed in line with the country's political views. For example, although they are controversial issues, the textbooks do not discuss Turkey's EU membership or the Armenian

issue and present examples of different opinions on this issue. Global warming is presented as the most important global issue in the Social Studies textbooks at all grade levels. The textbooks explain the causes of global warming, extinction of species, forest fires and reduction of water resources. The sixth and seventh-grade textbooks address economic problems such as scarcity of energy resources and health problems like avian flu and AIDS, and immigration in addition to the problem of global warming. On the other hand, the textbooks do not mention international cultural and political conflicts, violence or conflict, or global terrorism. While World Wars I and II and the Gulf War are referred as historical events, the genocides and human rights violations during these wars are not discussed.

### ***Intellectual Citizen: From Critical Thinking to Problem Solving***

The Social Studies textbooks provide activities to develop thinking skills such as interpreting, analyzing and synthesizing a political or social event at national and global level and critical thinking and problem solving skills very briefly. There are a few examples in the 6<sup>th</sup>, 7<sup>th</sup> and 8<sup>th</sup> grade textbooks about this. In the sixth-grade textbook, for example, students are supposed to evaluate their school council's work in an activity designed to develop critical thinking and they are asked how they could solve the problem of demolition of shanty houses in Ankara as an authorized person. The seventh-grade textbook states that citizens can declare their objection when false news is published and encourages citizens to think critically. The textbooks include only one or two examples to develop global problem-solving skills. For example, the seventh-grade textbook asks students what international institutions and organizations can do about global warming.

There are very few learning tasks about monitoring and interpreting political events in the Social Studies textbooks. Although the textbooks provide examples of newspaper and Internet news about current social issues, they do not emphasize that following them is an important citizenship qualification. Students are not required to think critically about these reports and analyze of the events to develop their problem solving skills. For example, when mentioning Radio and Television Supreme Council [RTSC], the textbooks do not sufficiently emphasize the importance of free press in democratic societies. Moreover, they do not state that watching current events is a quality that every citizen should have but they give the message that students should follow current events if they have future plans for a career in politics. The following is an example:

Oguzhan, a primary school fifth-grader, thinks that we can instantly be informed about the information produced on the development and changes in the world thanks to mass media. Oguzhan says that is why he follows current developments very closely and he never misses newscasts and news programs in particular. He says his greatest dream is to study politics and contribute to the country's development in the future... (MoNE, 2009d, p.19).

### ***Active Citizen: From Political Participation to Social Participation***

In the textbooks, political participation is associated with mayoral and legislative elections and participating in elections is regarded as both the right and duty of citizens. The textbooks also explain that the electoral process should be implemented based on secret ballot and open counting system and describe the requirements to vote and the conditions to be elected as members of parliament and the president. They also mention women's suffrage. However, the textbooks present just a few examples about to the public rights of political participation, such as creating public interest and writing petitions. They do not tell anything about students participating in decision-making processes of schools and local government units. Obviously, the current content of the textbooks tends to present political participation as limited to political elections.

Non-governmental organizations are depicted in relation to the value of solidarity rather than with political and social participation and protection of the rights. However, they indicate no relationship between citizenship and engagement in non-governmental organizations but they associate it with being good people and with moral values. For example, one of the textbooks state that “we can contribute to the improvement of social love, respect, tolerance and solidarity and to the solution of social problems by taking part in non-governmental organizations and clubs” (MoNE, 2009a, p.155). In addition, while the textbooks mention non-governmental organizations dealing with the environment and natural disasters rather than performing active political involvement, they exclude political organizations such as trade associations and unions.

In the textbooks, non-governmental organizations are described as kinds of organizations to which only good and volunteering people belong, but their potential influence on political decisions are ignored. There is one example, though, in the seventh-grade book about the toxic barrels reported by a citizen and the parliament’s discussion of the environmental law, which hadn’t been passed for the last 11 years, after the reflection of the incident in the media and because of the pressure by non-governmental organizations. Moreover, students are asked to make an evaluation by answering to the question ‘Have you ever witnessed that the decisions of those institutions and organizations in decision-making circles change as a result of local people’s effort?’ (MoNE, 2009d, p.151-152). The same textbook also explains that a non-governmental organization objected to an amendment in the coastal protection law and finally made a contribution to the environmental law. This example shows how non-governmental organizations and the media can play a role in forming public opinion and how it affects decision-making mechanisms. In addition, the textbooks give examples of newspaper reports on the non-governmental organizations’ activities and include questions for students that ask what would happen if weren’t for these organizations. They also invite students to search for the non-governmental organizations around them, to classify their operational areas, and to compare them with other official institutions and organizations (MoNE 2009d, p.120-127). The textbooks provide only one example of participation in international non-governmental organizations. The sixth-grade textbook mentions famed photographer Robert Knuth’s exhibition in Istanbul and other 30 countries about the destruction caused by Chernobyl disaster in people and the nature. To sum up, although this is the first time these textbooks deal with participation in the decisions of local and national level, this is still not enough. On the other hand, the Social Studies textbooks do not include activities to enable students take part in non-governmental organizations actively.

***Virtuous Citizen: From Loyalty, Belonging, Responsibility, Solidarity, Respect and Tolerance to Resolution of Conflict and Peace***

The Social Studies textbooks focus primarily on the national values, national commitment and national citizenship. National flag, national anthem, national language and national unity are strengthened through national independence and national history in the textbooks. All diversity in Turkey is presented under the umbrella of “the Turkish” in order to create a common national belonging and citizenship and the textbooks frequently use the concept of a Turkish citizen, and expressions of an embracing language like ‘our country’, ‘our citizens’. The textbooks, primarily mention the countries which Turkey has intense national, commercial and cultural ties with. While only economic relations among the countries of the world are highlighted, the idea of a politically and socially interdependent world is not discussed adequately. In addition, although the textbooks state that international relations have always existed throughout history with reference to the cross-cultural, economic and cultural relations in history, they do not provide any contemporary example of this. Moreover, the textbooks define neither ‘citizenship’ nor ‘citizenship of the world’ at all. World citizenship, as presented by these books, turns out to be a secondary trait behind

national citizenship. In other words, the Social Studies textbooks do not possess the content to raise students as responsible individuals who are sensitive to the problems of the world and to develop their feelings of world citizenship and commitment.

The Social Studies textbooks deal with national responsibility in three dimensions as responsibility to the social environment, the state and the natural environment. The fourth and fifth-grade textbooks mention responsibilities to the close social environment, the family, friends, student clubs and social events while the sixth, seventh and eighth-grade textbooks deal with the responsibilities to the state and the responsibilities to the natural environment. For example, the eighth-grade textbook suggests that individuals reach the consciousness of citizenship when they produce some useful services for the society they belong to and they are considered to be aware of their responsibilities. These responsibilities are listed as military service, paying taxes, voting, obeying the law and protecting the country. The same book highlights a communitarian perception of citizenship by providing a quote from Atatürk “the best individuals are those who put the society before themselves and sacrifice themselves for the sake of their society’s existence and happiness” (MoNE, 2009, p. 148). In the textbooks, responsibility at the global level is given in relation to the value of solidarity about protecting the environment and a common heritage. For example, when discussing the 2005 earthquake in Pakistan, the sixth-grade textbook asks students the following question “What would you expect from people in other countries in case of environmental disasters like this with devastating consequences?” (MoNE, 2009c, p.138) so that they can establish empathy and therefore presents responsibility not as a virtue of citizenship but as a requirement of being a good human and as a moral value. The seventh-grade textbook asks the question “Are we responsible for protecting the artifacts and common heritage we inherit from the past?” and encourages students to think about their individual responsibility to protect them (MoNE, 2009d, p. 174).

The textbooks tend to deal with moral and social tolerance more than political tolerance as a part of respect and tolerance. They attribute both national and global cultural diversity to geographic differences and have very little mention of ethnic and religious differences. The cultural differences in Turkey are presented as local customs, lifestyles, songs, food and clothes which vary across regions depending on geographical features of the seven regions. Cultural diversity in the world, on the other hand, is presented based on the geographical features of different countries in different climate zones and continents but there is no mention of religious and ethnic structures of these countries. For example, children from various countries introduce themselves in the fourth-grade textbook. A Pakistani boy introduces himself saying ‘Hello, my name is Parvez, my country is Pakistan, our official language is Urdu. My favorite dish is chicken roasting’ (MoNE, 2009a, p. 72). The chapter ‘Step by Step Turkey’ in the fifth-grade textbook shows ancient structures in different regions of Turkey and emphasizes respect for different cultural heritages with mottos like ‘We’re where different cultures live together’ and ‘Cultural diversity is richness’ (MoNE, 2009b, p. 50). Only the seventh-grade textbook states that cultural, religious and ethnic differences existed together in the Ottoman state. In general, the textbooks both display national and global differences and highlight the coexistence and living together. The fourth-grade textbook, for instance, deals with the culture of living together with the following words of a student preparing a report about children in the world:

I didn’t know there were so many different countries and cultures and people... Though these children look just like physically, they are very different from us in terms of cultural aspects. For example, are we speaking the same language with Elvis and Helene? No, we are not, but maybe Olanike and I have the same hobbies. Pelvez and I have similar skin color. This shows us that we have many things in common with other people even if they live at the other end of the world. They go to school just like us and most of our courses are the same... What is

more, we share the same feelings even if they are away... Apparently, we are all the children of the same world who live in separate places (MoNE, 2009a, p. 173).

The sixth-grade textbook include the letters of the students who visited Turkey and Slovenia and these letters are about eliminating mutual prejudices and tolerance and respect for cultures. In addition, there is a quote from Atatürk supporting tolerance: 'If people of various faiths have the hatred and contempt for each other, if they look down on each other, these are intolerant and narrow-minded people' (MoNE, 2009c, p. 141). Similarly, the sixth-grade textbook mentions Turkey's Antakya city, where people of three religions (Muslim, Christian, Jewish) live together and explains freedom of religion and conscience expressed in Article 24 of the Constitution. The inclusion of this article of law in the textbook is intended to imply that this law is not optional and citizens have to obey it. In summary, the textbooks give the impression that diversity is due to geographical factors and, although they refer to the respect for cultural differences, they do not give sufficient information about the different identities in the world at neither local nor global level.

Solidarity and cooperation are emphasized in the textbooks in historical issues and in resolution of national and global problems. Solidarity and cooperation are associated with national unity and in historical issues and with benevolence for non-governmental organizations. To illustrate, the fourth-grade textbook tells about the collective solidarity of women and men in war. The same book states that Atatürk did not start the war of independence until he managed to establish national unity and solidarity (MoNE, 2009a, p. 50). In this textbook, solidarity is explained in association with the values of national unity, sacrifice and hard work with following sentence: "We owe this land, where we live today, to our ancestors who fought at the expense of their lives all around Anatolia. We must protect our country against all kinds of danger with this awareness. We should be able to fight not only on the battlefield but in other areas as well" (MoNE, 2009a, p. 61). However, global solidarity and cooperation are emphasized less than national solidarity. Transnational solidarity is depicted with cases of disasters in the world in the fourth-grade textbook (MoNE, 2009a, p. 136) and in solving common environmental problems in the fifth-grade textbook. By asking students why the whole world is acting together for the protection of rain forests in Brazil, the latter book stresses the need for solidarity among countries in solving global problems (MoNE, 2009b, p. 195).

Conflict resolution and peace are among least discussed values in the Social Studies textbooks. Although the events of war are often covered in presenting national issues, conflict resolution and peace process before and after these wars are not often mentioned. Examples of conflict resolution are not depicted in relation to the daily lives of students. The seventh-grade textbook, however, points out that the purpose of the United Nations, which was founded after World War II, is to maintain international peace. This book also asks students to prepare a report based on the question "What are examples of solutions brought by the United Nations concerning international problems? However, it does not provide any past and present examples of the UN's contribution to international peace. In addition, it does not adequately deal with the responsibilities of governments and international institutions in the contemporary wars. The eighth-grade textbook, on the other hand, emphasizes that, following the foundation of the Republic of Turkey, Atatürk acted upon the principle of 'peace at home, peace in the world' and joined the UN and signed international agreements such as the Balkan Union for this purpose (MoNE, 2009, p. 184). This textbook also highlights that "the role of Turkey in the world peace is summarized by the principle of 'peace at home, peace in the world', which was established by Atatürk as one of the essential foundations of Turkish foreign policy. According to this principle of Atatürk, any problem that occurs anywhere in the world will affect the entire world and therefore, the world peace can only be achieved in cooperation with the countries of the world (MoNE, 2009, p. 202-203). In terms of civic virtues, the textbooks tend to emphasize national commitment and responsibility over respect

and tolerance, and conflict resolution and peace are among the least discussed values in the textbooks.

### **Conclusion and Implication**

The findings from this study indicate that the Social Studies textbooks in Turkey emphasize national issues more than global issues and they are designed in a way that help students to gain a national identity and perspective. The examples presented in these textbooks are neither sufficient nor adequate to develop a global sense of belonging and commitment. Therefore, global citizenship remains just as an effort to get to know the world from a national perspective in the Social Studies textbooks. The textbooks in question try to perceive both Europe and the world from “We” perspective. Research suggests that global citizenship is not sufficiently discussed in curriculums and textbooks in Turkey as well as many other countries (Çayır, 2009; Rosser, 2006; Philippou, 2009; Su, 2007; Tooth, 2008). Global citizenship education seems to be closely related to the process of globalization and multicultural political policies of countries.

This study also found that the textbooks in question provide very few examples to develop students’ questioning, evaluating and thinking skills about the political systems, events and issues in the country and around the world. This result is consistent with the results of similar research (Al-Barakat & Al-Karasneh, 2005; Çotuksöken, 2003, Romanowski, 1994). The fact that the Social Studies textbooks offer an apolitical citizenship education free of political events at both national and global level does not support students’ development of national and global levels of political literacy competencies. Research in some countries on textbooks reports that citizenship education is presented as something far from the politic framework (Su, 2007) and controversial issues are avoided (Wade, 1993). Having knowledge about political processes at both national and global level develops active citizens’ competencies of participation. Exclusion of political issues and problems in the Social Studies textbooks in Turkey could be associated with military coups and political incidents experienced in Turkey. Political and social events and military coups in Turkey seem to have made it difficult for educational activity and materials to deal with political issues.

The Social Studies textbooks examined in this study do not discuss participation in non-governmental organizations in connection with the concept of citizenship. The fact that these textbooks present participation in non-governmental organizations as being a good person and helping others could make it difficult for students to recognize it as a civic competence. In addition, there are hardly any examples of political and social participation at the global level. There are other studies suggesting that textbooks do not efficiently deal with political and social participation (Çayır, 2003; Collado & Atxurra, 2006; Sayılan, 2009; Wade & Everett, 1994). It is essential that textbooks present participation in non-governmental organizations as a competence of citizenship in order to develop students’ active citizenship competences. In addition, textbooks should include some activities to encourage students to actively participate in non-governmental organizations.

This study also revealed that while equality is highlighted as a right of citizens to be equal before the law, the issue of social equality and justice are not mentioned. The textbooks associate equality with cooperation and solidarity at both national and global levels without reference to the concept of social justice. In that respect, the Social Studies textbooks in this study are far from reflecting the concept of the ‘welfare state’ adopted by the state of the Republic of Turkey. Social justice is one of the key points of social peace at both national and global level and it should be one of the fundamental values to be taught by Social Studies courses. In the textbooks, gender equality is emphasized on the basis of laws and rights. Evidently, problems experienced by women are excluded and social dimensions of equality are not discussed adequately. Research conducted in earlier years in Turkey suggests that

there is gender inequality in textbooks (Sayılan, 2009; Tanrıöver, 2003). According to these results, equality and justice, which are among the fundamental principles of democracy, are issues which are discussed in the textbooks on the basis of rights but the social dimension of which is ignored.

One of the most important values that citizens should have today is respect for diversity and tolerance. In the study, the textbooks tend to attribute cultural differences to geographic differences and have very little mention of ethnic and religious differences at both national and global level. Although the textbooks state that there is a need for respect and tolerance for different cultures at both national and global level, they do not clearly explain the differences. Similar results are also reported by research conducted into the textbooks in Turkey (Çayır, 2009; Gemalmaz, 2003; Evin & Kafadar, 2004). Sayılan (2009) states that in textbooks, diversity is decontextualized and reduced to learning styles and psychological mood, cultural diversity is ignored and therefore a passive concept of citizenship is promoted. There are also findings from studies outside Turkey suggesting that textbooks do not sufficiently deal with multiculturalism and minority rights (Collado & Atxurra, 2006; Çayır, 2003; Gök, 2003; Lee, 2010; Montgomery, 2005; Nasser & Nasser, 2008; Philippou, 2009; Pinson, 2007; Plattoeva, 2009; Rezai-Rashti & McCarthy, 2008). These results suggest that national point of view is prevalent in the textbooks in Turkey as well as in some other countries and textbooks still fail to emphasize respect for diversity and tolerance. Evidently, with their current content, the Social Studies textbooks in Turkey do not adequately support the development of the perception of a multicultural and cosmopolitan citizenship. However, multiculturalism is the basis of active and democratic citizenship. Unfortunately, the Social Studies textbooks in Turkey are not yet capable of developing global citizenship in terms of multiculturalism.

Among the least discussed issues in the textbooks are taking responsibility, solidarity and cooperation at the global level while responsibility for global environmental problems is emphasized most. At the national level, solidarity and cooperation are presented in relation to national unity during the War of Independence and natural disaster whereas they are emphasized in association with global disasters, global warming and protection of common cultural heritage at the global level. The textbooks should more efficiently emphasize solidarity and cooperation in solving global problems. Conflict resolution and peace are among the least discussed values and competences in the textbooks both at national and global level. Similar research results reveal that textbooks do not adequately present conflict resolution (Collado & Atxurra, 2006). Gemalmaz (2003) states that according to previous studies of textbooks in Turkey, killing and thus dying are justified and associated with citizenship, a culture of peace is not developed, and resolution of disputes by peaceful means is not included in textbooks. However, one of the active and democratic citizenship competences is solving conflicts without turning to violence in everyday life at both national and international level and playing an active role in solving problems and taking responsibility. Therefore, in the Social Studies textbooks should associate peace, conflict and problem-solving skills without violence with citizenship and include activities to develop these competences at every grade level.

In conclusion, it is clear that the Social Studies textbooks in Turkey needs revising in both national and global dimensions so that students can be raised as active and democratic citizens. In the textbooks, activities to develop national and global citizenship skills and values are not repeated in a sustainable and phased manner. There should be a number of sample activities according to students' level of maturity in each grade level to encourage them think about and question political and social events. Therefore, the Social Studies textbooks should be revised in terms of the following points in order to develop an understanding of national and global citizenship:

- Topics related to global economic, social, political and cultural structures, decision-making institutions and organizations should be added and interdependence of countries around the world should be emphasized.
- Cultural differences should be explained as much as possible by covering religious and ethnic differences in addition to geographical factors so as to develop respect for diversity and tolerance at national and global level.
- Critical perspective on global economic, cultural and environmental issues should be provided and some tasks should be designed to solve these problems.
- National issues should be given in relation to the global level. Sense of belonging should be strengthened with emphasis on partnership for world citizenship.

This study provided only a general comparison of the Social Studies textbooks in terms of national and global citizenship. The textbooks should be analyzed more elaborately in terms of each competence and value of active and democratic citizenship. In addition, curricula and textbooks of other courses in elementary education should be examined in terms of national and global citizenship. Thus, data to be obtained from these studies will contribute to the improvement of textbooks in Turkey and around the world based on modern and contemporary approaches and with an understanding of global citizenship.

#### *Appendix: The Textbooks Analyzed*

- MoNE. (2005a). Primary School Social Studies Curriculum and Manual (4-5. Grades). Directorate of State Books Publishing House, Ankara, Turkey.
- MoNE. (2005b). Primary School Social Studies Curriculum and Manual (6-7. Grades). Directorate of State Books Publishing House, Ankara, Turkey.
- MoNE. (2009a). Social Studies Textbook (Primary 4<sup>th</sup> Grade). 5<sup>th</sup> edition. Ihlas Publishing, Istanbul, Turkey
- MoNE. (2009b). Social Studies Textbook (Primary 5<sup>th</sup> Grade). 5<sup>th</sup> edition. Ihlas Publishing, Istanbul, Turkey.
- MoNE. (2009c). Social Studies Textbook (Primary 6<sup>th</sup> Grade). 5<sup>th</sup> edition. Ihlas Publishing, Istanbul, Turkey.
- MoNE. (2009d). Social Studies Textbook (Primary 7<sup>th</sup> Grade). 5<sup>th</sup> edition. Ihlas publishing, Istanbul, Turkey.
- MoNE. (2009e). Republic of Turkey Revolution History and Kemalism. (Primary 8<sup>th</sup> grade). 2<sup>nd</sup> edition. Kelebek Press., Istanbul, Turkey.

#### **References**

- Al-Barakat, A. A. & Al-Karasneh, S. M. (2005). Textbooks in the early grades of education in preparing young children to become effective citizens: teachers' perspective. *Journal of Early Childhood Research* 3, 169-191.
- Aslan, C., Karaman-Kepenekçi, Y. (2008). Human rights education: a comparison of mother tongue textbooks in Turkey and France. *Mediterranean Journal of Educational Studies*, 13(1), 101-124.
- Banks, J. A. (2004). Democratic citizenship education in multicultural societies. In: Banks, J. A. (Ed.), *Diversity and Citizenship Education: Global Perspectives*. Jossey-Bass, San Francisco, pp. 3-17.
- Bowen, G. A. (2009). Document analysis as a qualitative research method. *Qualitative*

*Research Journal*, 9(2), 27-40.

- Braun, V., Clarke, V. (2006). Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative Research in Psychology*, 3(2), 77-101.
- Brindle, P., Arnot, M. (1999). England Expects Every Man to do his Duty’: The gendering of the citizenship textbook 1940-1966. *Oxford Review of Education*, 25, 103-123.
- Brodie, J. (2004). Globalization and citizenship beyond the national state. *Citizenship Studies*, 8 (4), 323–332.
- Crawford, K. (2004). Inter-cultural education: the role of school textbook analysis in shaping a critical discourse on nation and society. Paper presented Pacific Circle Consortium 27th Annual Conference. Accessed from <http://iediis4.ied.edu.hk/pcc2004/B-D/Inter-CulturalEducation.pdf> on November, 2011.
- Çayır, K. (2009). Preparing Turkey for the European Union: nationalism, national identity and ‘otherness’ in Turkey’s new textbooks. *Journal of Intercultural Studies* 30, 39-55.
- Çayır, K. (2003). Awareness of human rights and democracy in textbooks. In: Çotuksöken, B., Erzan, A., Siller, O. (Eds.). *Human Rights In Textbooks: Survey Results*. Turkey Economic and Social Foundation Press, Istanbul, Turkey, pp.90-105.
- Collado, M. D. L. C., Atxurra, R. L. (2006). Democratic citizenship in textbooks in Spanish primary curriculum. *Journal of Curriculum Studies*, 38(2), 205–228.
- Davies, L. (2006). Global citizenship: abstraction or framework for action? *Educational Review* 58, 5–25.
- Dong-Bae, L. (2010). Portrayals of non-North Koreans in North Korean textbooks and the formation of national identity. *Asian Studies Review*, 34, 349–369.
- European Commission [EC]. (2007). Key competences for lifelong learning: European Reference Framework. Accessed from [http://ec.europa.eu/dgs/education\\_culture/publ/pdf/learning/keycomp\\_en.pdf](http://ec.europa.eu/dgs/education_culture/publ/pdf/learning/keycomp_en.pdf) on October 21, 2011.
- Evans, C. S. (1987). Teaching a global perspective in elementary classrooms. *The Elementary School Journal*, 87, 544-555.
- Evin, I., Kafadar, O. (2004). Content analysis of primary school social studies textbooks in terms of national and universal values. *Turkish Journal of Educational Sciences*, 32(2), 293-302.
- Firer, R. (1998). Human rights in history and civics textbooks: the case of Israel. *Curriculum Inquiry* 28(2), 195-208.
- Gemalmaz, M. A. (2003). Evaluation of the data obtained by scanning textbooks in terms of human rights criteria. In: Çotuksöken, B., Erzan, A., Siller, O. (Eds.), *Human Rights in Textbooks: Survey Results*. The Turkish Economic and Social Foundation Publications. Istanbul, Turkey, pp.23-64.

- Gök, F. (2003). Citizenships and human rights education in textbooks. In: Çotuksöken, B., Erzan, A., Siller, O. (Eds.), *Human Rights in Textbooks: Survey Results*. The Turkish Economic and Social Foundation Publications. Istanbul, Turkey, pp. 158-171.
- Gürses, F., Pazarıcı, G. N. (2010). Impact of political agenda on the concept of citizenship: a review on textbooks. Karaburun Science Congress. Accessed from [http://www.kongrekaraburun.org/tam\\_metinler\\_2010/a\\_8/02\\_Fatma\\_Gurses\\_ve\\_Nilgun\\_Gurkan\\_Pazarci.pdf](http://www.kongrekaraburun.org/tam_metinler_2010/a_8/02_Fatma_Gurses_ve_Nilgun_Gurkan_Pazarci.pdf) on September 20, 2011.
- Imada, T. (2010). Cultural narratives of individualism and collectivism: a content analysis of textbook stories in the United States and Japan. *Journal of Cross-Cultural Psychology*, 20, 1-16.
- Kadıoğlu, A. (2007). Denationalization of citizenship: the Turkish experience. *Citizenship Studies*, 11(3), 283-299.
- Keating, A. (2009). Educating Europe's citizens: moving from national to post-national models of educating for European citizenship. *Citizenship Studies*, 13(2), 135-151.
- Keating, A., Ortloff, d. H., Philippou, S. (2009). Citizenship education curricula: the changes and challenges presented by global and European integration. *Journal of Curriculum Studies*, 41(2), 145-158.
- Kepenekçi, Y. (2005). Citizenship and human rights education: a comparison of textbooks in Turkey and the United States. *International Journal of Educational Reform*, 14, 73-88.
- Kepenekçi, Y. (2008). Human rights education: A comparison of mother tongue textbooks in Turkey and France. *Mediterranean Journal of Educational Studies*, 13(1), 101-124.
- Kılıç-Oğuz, A. (2007). *Devoted Spouse-devoted Citizen: Civics and Citizenship Education, 1970-1990*. Kitap Publications, Istanbul, Turkey.
- Lebrun, J., Lenoir, Y, Laforest, M., Larose, F., Roy, G. R., Spallanzani, C., Pearson, M. (2002). Past and current trends in the analysis of textbooks in a Quebec context. *Curriculum Inquiry*, 32(1), 51-83.
- Lee, I. (2011). Teaching how to discriminate: globalization, prejudice, and textbooks. *Teacher Education Quarterly*, 38(1), 47-63.
- Lee, D-B. (2010). Portrayals of non-North Koreans in North Korean textbooks and the formation of national identity. *Asian Studies Review*, 34, 349-369.
- Marshall, H. (2009). Educating the European citizen in the global age: engaging with the post-national and identifying a research agenda. *Journal of Curriculum Studies*, 41, 247-267.
- MoNE. (2001). The needs for developing the new education programs in Turkey. Accessed from [http://ttkb.meb.gov.tr/programlar/prog\\_giris/prog\\_giris\\_1.html](http://ttkb.meb.gov.tr/programlar/prog_giris/prog_giris_1.html) on January 23, 2011.
- Meyer, John W., Bromley, P., Ramirez, F. O. (2010). Human rights in social science textbooks: cross-national analyses, 1970-2008. *Sociology of Education*, 83(2), 111-

134.

- Montgomery, K. (2005). Banal race-thinking: ties of blood, Canadian history textbooks and ethnic nationalism. *Paedagogica Historica*, 41(3), 313–336
- Moss, G. (2010). Textbook language, ideology and citizenship: the case of a history textbook in Colombia. *Functions of Language*, 17(1), 71–93.
- Naseem, M. A. (2006). The soldier and the seductress: a post-structuralist analysis of gendered citizenship through inclusion in and exclusion from language and social studies textbooks in Pakistan. *International Journal of Inclusive Education*, 10, 449–467.
- NCSS. (1982). Position statements on global education. NCSS, Washington, DC.
- Nasser, R., Nasser, I. (2008). Textbooks as a vehicle for segregation and domination: state efforts to shape Palestinian Israelis' identities as citizens. *Journal of Curriculum Studies*, 40(5), 627-650.
- Quillen, I. J. (1944). Education for world citizenship. *Annals of the American academy of political and social science*. 235, 122-127.
- Oxfam. (1997) A curriculum for global citizenship. OXFAM. Accessed from [http://www.oxfam.org.uk/education/gc/files/education\\_for\\_global\\_citizenship\\_a\\_guide\\_for\\_schools.pdf](http://www.oxfam.org.uk/education/gc/files/education_for_global_citizenship_a_guide_for_schools.pdf) on January 25, 2011.
- Özkan, R. (2010). Protectionist values in Turkish education system: sample primary education course book. *International Journal of Human Sciences*, 7, 1124-1141.
- Philippou, S. (2009). What makes Cyprus European? Curricular responses of Greek-Cypriot civic education to 'Europe'. *Journal of Curriculum Studies*, 41(2), 199–223.
- Pinson, H. (2007). Inclusive curriculum? challenges to the role of civic education in a Jewish and democratic state. *Curriculum Inquiry*, 37(4), 351-380.
- Rezai-Rashti, G. M., McCarthy, C. (2008). Race, text, and the politics of official knowledge: a critical investigation of a social science textbook in Ontario. *Discourse: Studies in the Cultural Politics of Education*, 29(4), 527-540.
- Plattoeva N. (2009). Citizenship and nationality in changing Europe: a comparative study of the aims of citizenship education in Russian and Finnish national education policy texts. *Journal of Curriculum Studies*, 41(6), 723–744.
- Romanowski, M. H. (1994). Fleeing from democratic ideals: the content of US history textbook. Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development. Chicago, Il. (ED 389650).
- Rosser, Y. C. (2006). The islamization of Pakistani social studies textbook. In What Shall we tell the children? In: Foster, S. J., Crawford K. A. (Eds.), *Information Age*. Publishing, USA, pp.156-179.
- Sayılan, F. (2009). Adult literacy and basic education program and literacy textbooks: critical discourse analysis. *Education Science Society Journal*, 7(26), 39-68.

- Su, Y. (2007). Ideological representations of Taiwan's history: an analysis of elementary social studies textbooks, 1978–1995. *Curriculum Inquiry*, 37(3), 205-237.
- Suárez, D. F. (2008). Rewriting citizenship? civic education in Costa Rica and Argentina. *Comparative Education*, 44, 485-503.
- Terra, L. (2008). Conflict and the adoption of civic norms: a textbook analysis of civic identity in Northern Ireland. Master of Arts. Stanford University, School of Education
- Tanrıöver, H, U. (2003). Gender discrimination in textbooks. human rights in textbooks: survey results. In: Çotuksöken, B., Erzan, A., Siller, O. (Eds.), *Human Rights in Textbooks: Survey Results*. The Turkish Economic and Social Foundation Publications. Istanbul, Turkey, pp. 106-121.
- Tooth, J. (2008). Reflections of citizenship and citizenship education in Manitoba civics textbooks, 1911 - 2007: An exploratory study. The University of Manitoba, Doctoral Dissertation.
- Ustel, F. (2004). *Obeyed Citizens: Citizenship Education from 2<sup>nd</sup> Constitutional Monarchy to Today*. Iletisim Publishing, Istanbul, Turkey.
- Wade, R. C., Everett, S. (1994). Civic participation in third grade social studies textbooks. *Social Education*, 58, 308-319.
- Wade, R. C. (1993). Content analysis of social studies textbooks: a review of ten years of research. *Theory and Research in Social Education*, 21(3), 232-256.
- Wang, C.L. (1999). National identity and the controversies regarding the new subject: 'Knowing Taiwan' in the R.O.C. The paper presented at The Annual Meeting of The American Educational Research Association. Montreal, Quebec, Canada.