

Examination of the Postgraduate Theses on Teachers' Views of Values Education in Turkey: A Meta Synthesis Study

Sibel Cengizhanⁱ
Marmara University

Abstract

This research study carried out to examine the postgraduate theses on teachers' views of the values education in Turkey was designed as a meta synthesis study. Postgraduate theses were obtained from the National Thesis Center of the Council of Higher Education. During the research process, these steps were followed;(1) determining the research subject, (2) selecting the studies to be included in the study, (3) picking and presenting the data, (4) ensuring validity and reliability and (5) analyzing the data and explaining the synthesis. Content analysis was used in the analysis of the data. The qualitative findings of the 24 theses included in the study were examined singly and as a result of the examination three main themes were determined; Applications practiced to gain values education and problems encountered, The values that should be gained by the students according to the teachers and the factors effective in gaining these values, The problems that the values education can deliver solution and the behavioral changes observed in the students after the values education practices. From the findings of the research, it was concluded that the teachers mostly used the drama method to gain of values education, that there were problems experienced caused by the family in practice, and that the practices could solve the problem of injustice the most.

Keywords: Values Education, Teachers' Opinions, Meta Synthesis

DOI: 10.29329/ijpe.2021.346.17

ⁱ **Sibel Cengizhan**, Assoc. Prof., Educational Sciences, Marmara University Atatürk Faculty of Education, ORCID: 0000-0001-5862-2927

Email: sibel@marmara.edu.tr

INTRODUCTION

With the developing science and technology, the characteristics expected from the individual have also changed, and in line with this differentiation, the ability to live in harmony, to be sensitive, to take responsibility, to be fair, to share, to produce original solutions to problems and many similar values have gained importance. Therefore, values education has become an essential part of education.

The concept of value is defined by Ulusoy and Dilmaç (2015) as “Abstract measure determining importance in something, return, preciousness, high and useful quality”, Özkan (2010) defined the concept of value as “social behavior patterns that guarantee individuals' life in society and facilitate their lives” in one of his studies. Similarly, the concept of value was expressed by Kaşkaya and Duran (2017) as a whole of rules and norms that exist in all areas of life. While Halstead (1996) defines the concept of value as the standards and principles we use in making correct decisions, according to Arthur (2003), value is defined as a set of interrelated personal principles that lead a person to take an action. Also Lockwood (2009) expressed the concept of value as the criteria a person uses when making a decision about an object, person or action. Although the definitions seem to be expressed in different ways, in fact there are basic points that they have in common, which is just like the universality of values. Based on the common points in all these definitions, the concept of value can be defined as a set of certain principles or behavior patterns that build a bridge between the individual and life and affect the individual in making decisions and in practice. Considering that the priority and importance of the society in which the individual lived in gaining these patterns is effective, it can be concluded that the values differ, and these differences cause different classifications. When the classification of values is examined, it is observed that the value classifications of Spranger, Rokeach and Schwartz are mostly the ones taken part in the literature. While Spranger classified values under six headings as scientific, economic, aesthetic, social, political and religious (Hermans and Oles, 1994), Rokeach divided values into two as ends and means. He stated the ends goals as individual life goals (inner harmony, comfortable life, mature love etc.) and as social goals (world peace, equality, national security etc.) on the other hand, he defined the means goals as personal characteristics or behavior syndromes (ambitious, independent, loyal, responsible etc.) (Mueller and Wornhoff, 1990). Schwartz who defines the concept of value as the changing and desired transition goals that serve as the guiding principles in a person's life classified values personally and culturally and he revealed ten motivational values from this classification; achievement, helpfulness, compliance, hedonism, strength, security, self-direction, stimulation, tradition and universalism (Devos, Spini and Schwartz, 2002; Schwartz, 1994; Spini, 2003).

Considering that education plays an important role in the formation of these principles, it can be said that the emergence of the concept of "value education" is inevitable. This concept can be expressed as a design that enables a person to develop social, moral, aesthetic and spiritual aspects, and teaches to protect and transfer our cultural values (Venkataiah, 2007; Genc & Eryaman, 2008). It is a known fact that this design is carried out first in the family and then in schools. Halstead and Taylor (2000) also emphasize that the school has two important roles; to enable children to think and make sense of their own developing values and to support these values.

Studies on values education in Turkey were put into practice with the values education directive issued by the Board of Education in 2010 and with this directive, practices of values education in all primary and secondary schools started (MEB, 2010). In 2017, a statement on "On Our Studies for Renewal and Change in the Curriculum" was published by the Board of Education and ten main values were identified, namely justice, friendship, honesty, self-control, patience, respect, love, responsibility, patriotism, and helpfulness (Topal, 2019). An effective value education application in schools may bring solution for many problems that may arise in the education system. For example, in a study conducted by Cafağlı and Somuncuoğlu (2000), it was determined that students' dishonesty, impatience and violent behavior decreased as a result of the implementation of a program developed for values education. Osterman (2000) determined that at the end of the values education program he applied, students' negative behaviors related to inability to express themselves, violence and non-

communication changed in a positive way. Kunduroğlu (2010) found that students exhibit positive behaviors of scientific value as a result of the values education program implemented in a study he conducted. In the studies conducted by Aladağ (2009), Aydemir Özbay (2019), Dilmaç (2007) and Hayta Önal (2005), positive developments were observed in students' responsibility behaviors. Another study in which positive results were revealed in gaining the value of being fair with the practice of values education was carried out by Izgar (2013) and İpekçi (2018). Also, it was concluded that the classroom activities conducted by Öğretici (2011) regarding the values of sensitivity and responsibility provided the students with the gains regarding these values. In this context, it is thought that taking teachers' opinions in order to improve values education practices and make them more effective and efficient will contribute to the functioning of the researcher. Therefore, the main purpose of the research was determined as the examination of the postgraduate theses conducted on teacher views regarding the values education in Turkey by meta synthesis approach and the following questions were sought:

1. What are the applications made for the acquisition of values education and what are the problems encountered in these applications?
2. According to teachers, what values should students gain and what are the effective factors in gaining these values?
3. What are the teachers' opinions on the problems that values education can solve and the behavioral changes observed in students after the values education practices?

METHOD

Research Model

The research is designed as a meta synthesis study. Meta synthesis is a research approach that includes the analysis, method and findings of qualitative research done on a subject (Paterson, Thorne, Canam, & Jillings, 2001). This approach shows how data from qualitatively conducted studies can be brought together and summarized effectively and their results can be revealed with a more holistic view (Major & Savin-Baden, 2010). Starting from this, postgraduate theses on teachers' views on values education between the years 1999-2020 in Turkey were examined in this study. The theses were accessed from the Higher Education Council National Thesis Center.

Research Process

When literature on meta-synthesis and studies designed with meta-synthesis are examined, it is seen that the research process follows similar steps with small differences (Denner, Campe, & Werner, 2019; Lachal, Revay-Levy, Orri, Morro, 2017; Paterson, Thorne, Canam and Jillings, 2001; Tannenbaum and others, 2015). Therefore, the following steps were followed in the research process of this study:

1. Determination of the research subject: In determining the research subject, firstly the literature on education of values was examined and the subjects in which the studies were concentrated were determined. In applied studies, it was determined that there are studies about examining the values often contained in textbooks, reflections of values education on education programs, determining the effectiveness of applied values education programs and receiving teacher and student opinions on values education. Then, the postgraduate theses on values education in Turkey were examined and it was determined that 291 theses were written in total. Of these theses, 226 are at master's level and 65 are at doctoral level. When the distribution of the theses by years is examined, it is determined that the least number of theses were made in 1999, 2007 and 2009, with 2 theses each. The highest number of theses on the subject belongs to 2019 (104), and the number of master theses made this year is 96 and the number of doctoral theses is 8.

2. Selecting the Studies to be included in the Study: In the research, studies particularly involving teachers' opinions were included. Because it is thought that values education program can best evaluated by the teachers as practitioners. For this purpose, in order to determine the theses to be included in the study, two keywords were determined; values education and teachers' opinions. Each study was examined one by one, they were checked whether they had the specified keywords, and whether the methods and data analysis sections of the theses were explained in detail. As a result of the examination, it was determined that there were 40 theses in which teachers' opinions on values education were examined. When the determined 40 theses were examined, it was seen that a total of 5 mixed studies were conducted, one in 2013, 2016 and 2017, and 2 in 2019. When the distribution of studies conducted by quantitative method by years is considered, it was determined that a total of 9 studies were conducted, one in 2008, 2010, 2016, 2015, 2 in 2017, and 3 in 2019. When the distribution of the studies using the qualitative method by years is examined, it was determined that a total of 26 postgraduate theses were made, one in 2008, 2010, 2012 and 2020, 2 in 2013 and 2016, 3 in 2015, 4 in 2017, 7 in 2018, and 18 in 2019.

3. Picking and Presenting the Data: Due to the purpose and nature of meta-synthesis studies, 26 postgraduate theses in which teachers' views on values education where qualitative data are collected were re-examined and since the opinions of the teachers who participated in a project on education of values in two theses were evaluated, these theses were sorted out and 24 theses were examined in the research. 24 theses included in the study were coded as T1, T2, T3, T4... starting from thesis 1 and classified in terms of their subjects. According to the classification; it was determined that there are 4 theses (T1, T13, T18 and T22) in which opinions on applications were received, 2 theses (T12 and T14) in which the opinions about the teaching materials produced and used were received, 5 theses (T2, T10, T16, T19 and T20) in which general opinions are examined, 3 theses (T4, T5 and T11) in which opinions on values education and practices are discussed together, 3 theses (T15, T17 and T21) about the examination of values education in the textbook and 7 theses (T3, T6, T7, T8, T9, T23 and T24) related to values education in the curriculum. In the findings of the participants in these studies, it was determined that the opinions of preschool (4) teachers, then social studies teachers (2), elementary school teachers (2) and Quran course teachers (2) were consulted the most. The branches from which at least (1) opinion were taken are Geography, science, visual arts, primary school, secondary school, English and high school teachers. As data collection tools for receiving opinion, it was determined that semi-structured interview form was used in 18 of the theses, semi-structured interview form and document analysis form were used in 5 of the theses and semi-structured interview form and observation form were used together in 1 of them. Content analysis (14), descriptive analysis (9), descriptive and content analysis techniques (1) were used in the analysis of the data obtained from these theses, respectively.

4. Validity and Reliability: An external evaluator was used to ensure reliability in the findings (Smart, 2004). The external evaluator examined a total of 7 theses selected from the research sample, one for each year. The collected data were coded and themed independently by the external evaluator and the author and rearranged. In order to ensure the reliability of the study. In calculating the reliability, the reliability formula $R (\text{reliability}) = \frac{Na (\text{consensus})}{Na (\text{consensus}) + Nd (\text{disagreement})}$ suggested by Miles and Huberman (1994) was used and the reliability of the research was determined as 0.72 as a result of the calculation. Since the reliability calculations found to be above 70% are considered reliable for the research (Miles & Huberman, 1994), the result obtained was considered reliable for the research. As stated by Yıldırım and Şimşek (2005), in order to ensure the validity of the results, the research questions were clearly stated, detailed information about the analyzed data was presented and direct quotations were included in the interpretations of the findings obtained from the theses.

5. Analysis of Data and Explanation of Synthesis: Content analysis technique was used in the analysis of the data obtained from the research. Content analysis enables the findings to be brought together within the framework of certain concepts and themes that are similar to each other, and organized and interpreted in a way that the reader can understand (Yıldırım & Şimşek, 2005). The

qualitative findings of the 24 theses included in the study were examined singly and as a result of the examination three main themes were determined; Applications practiced to gain values education and problems encountered, The values that should be gained by the students according to the teachers and the factors effective in gaining these values, The problems that the values education can deliver solution and the behavioral changes observed in the students after the values education practices. The results of the synthesis were presented in the form of comments in tables in the findings section of the research, and the citations made from the examined theses were given directly.

FINDINGS

In this part of the research, the findings related to the three themes obtained from the qualitative data of 24 graduate theses examined are presented in the form of comments and direct quotations under the title of research questions. Page numbers of theses are also given in direct quotations.

1. Findings Regarding Applications practiced to gain values education and problems encountered

In line with the first question of the study, the theses were examined and two themes were determined; the practices of teachers in teaching values education and the problems encountered in these practices. Regarding the first theme, it was observed that in the acquisition of values education, firstly drama (15), then a case study (11) and storytelling (10) about values education were practiced. Besides these, it was determined that educational games about the value to be gained (9), art activities such as music, painting, film and theater (9), project work (7), billboard preparation (7), narration (6), discussion (6), writing an essay about the subject (5), travel-observation activities (5), family visits (4), role modeling (4), Science and nature activities (3), feeding a living being (3), animation with puppets (3), poster preparation (3), presenting examples from daily life (3), empathy activities (3), brainstorming (3), choosing the model student of the month (3), reading poetry about values (2), examining social experiments (2) and reading books (2) applications were practiced. Some quotations from the thesis examined regarding these findings are presented below.

“Animating events or concepts we encounter in daily life in the classroom, that is, drama, will enable students to realize the importance of values” (T7, p.72). “Sometimes I can have difficulties when internalizing and teaching values. In such situations, we give examples from daily life and do drama” (T8, p.206). “I use all methods such as case study, discussion, brainstorming, narration. I mostly use the case study method” (T15, p.92). “I make the students perceive the value based on something they are curious about during the lesson or the case study that happened at that moment” (T20, p.60). “... We read story books. We have resource books, we plan activities” (T9, p.90).

When the theme of the problems encountered in practice has been examined, it was determined that families do not contribute to the process in the first place (14). The problems following come after this problem; having a low number of variety of activities and materials in the values education program (13), crowded classes (10), presence of negative examples presented by mass media such as social media, television series, television programs, YouTube phenomena, internet, etc.(10), the concepts being abstract (10), unsuitability of the physical environment (9), incompatibility of family values and universal values (9), insufficient teaching hours (9), insufficient in-service teacher training (8), the families not being conscious (8), teacher's being a wrong role model (6), priority to teaching over education (5), self-centered preschool students (4), behavioral differences among teachers (3) and unclear course outcomes (3) . Some quotations from the thesis examined regarding these findings are presented below.

“While teacher-student communication at school is within the framework of respect and love, the families' ignoring this and doing what they know, not obeying the rules, disregarding them and not repeating the classroom activities at home cause disruption of values and the emergence of inconsistent behaviors (T3, p67).” “... .. In my opinion, if I answer by considering the environment I am in, I can easily say that our biggest deficiency stems from the families (T14, p.72).” “Timeless, improper, unconscious consumption of mass media, social media, TV programs, besides their misuse, the fact that they make programs that corrupt our values causes serious damage on values (T8, p.203).”

2. Findings regarding the values that should be acquired by students according to teachers and the factors effective in gaining these values

In line with the second question of the research, the theses were examined and 2 themes were determined, namely, what values should be gained according to the teacher's opinions and the factors that are effective in gaining these values. In the first theme, for the values that should be given to students according to teachers, it was determined that first comes respect (14), in the second place it's honesty (13), and in the third place it is responsibility (12) and love (12). Helping each other (11), tolerance (10), justice (9), empathy (8), patriotism (7), sharing (7), self-confidence (7), patience (6), conscience (3), cooperation (2) and equality (2) follow these values respectively. Among the theses examined regarding these findings, the value of respect takes the first place in the theses coded T3, T10, T15 and T20 and the quotations regarding this value are as follows:

“First of all, respect must be gained. Respect is essential for the development of a children's sense of self-confidence, for getting along well with their friends, and most importantly, for them to become characterful people in their future life (T3, p.56).” “First of all, we need to teach to be respectful at the ages of secondary school... .. (T10, p.72).” Honesty value came out as the second most important value that should be gained to students also in the thesis coded T11. The opinion of a teacher on this subject is as follows: *“Personally, my most important value is not lying, honesty; I attach great importance to it... ” (p.52).* When codes in order of priority in teaching values in theses with T8 and T11, T16 and T17 codes were examined, it was found that responsibility and love values ranked third. Some opinions about these values are expressed as follows: *“... A sense of responsibility should be given. Individuals who are aware of their responsibilities do their duties properly. Value of responsibility should be given. There is no information or school for a student who does not know what and why... (T19, p.58).” “Since people live together, I put the value of responsibility and sensitivity first.... (T20, p.44).”*

When the second theme of the factors that are effective in providing values education is examined, it was determined that in the first place, it is the family's necessity to be the right role model (5). This factor is followed by these; the teacher's being the right role model (3), family consistency (3), school culture (3), social media, television, etc. mass media (3), consciousness level of the family (2), family-teacher cooperation (2), universities, municipalities, health institutions, non-governmental organizations etc., private and public institutions (2), the support of the guidance service (1). Some of the opinions expressed by the teachers regarding these factors are given below.

“... I think the most important factor is family. After, it is an important factor that students fall into the exam rush brought by the system.... and.... The family factor is particularly effective(T19, p.56).” “I try to set an example to teach the values education outcomes, not as if to explain the subject of a lesson, but to teach the subjects of values education with my behavior when necessary... .. (T1, p.44).” “Since there are violent elements in the computer games, I observe that the child resorts to violence to get something. Likewise,

the presence of elements of violence on TV also makes it difficult for the child to learn values (T3, p.71)."

3. Findings of teachers' opinions about the problems that values education can solve and the behavioral changes observed in students after values education practices

In line with the third question of the research, the theses were examined and two themes were obtained: the problems that values education can solve and the behavioral changes observed in the students after the applications.

Regarding the first theme, it was determined that the teachers think that values education can bring a solution to the problem of injustice (5) the most. After that they indicated that it would be a solution to physical and psychological violence (4), lying (4), disrespect (3), lack of love for homeland, nation and flag (3), impatience (3), communication problems (3), failure (3), being judgmental (2) and not being able to express oneself (2). Some quotations regarding the views of teachers in theses where the problems that values education can solve are presented below:

"First of all, I believe that values education will solve the problems of violence, fighting, failure and discipline in schools... .. (T5, p.77)." *"I think that violence can be solved with an effective values education. The student should use it in social activities in their spare time. Sports areas should be created to spend their energy. I think that violence can be solved if these values education is started to be given to the students at all hands; on the street, in the family, in the media (T1, 108)."* *"I think it can contribute to the solution of the problems such as violence, disrespect, inability and inequality that are increasing in our society (T2, p.29)."*

When the opinions of teachers in the second theme regarding the behavioral changes observed in students after the values education applications are examined, it was found that respectively the behaviors of being respectful (7), sharing (6) and helping each other (5) were positively changed. These behavior changes are followed by those; being responsible (4), being self-confident (4), paying attention to cleanliness (3), finding solutions to problems (3), being patient (3), being tolerant (3), empathizing (3), showing love to all living things (3), not lying (3), less violent tendency (3) and fairness (2). Some quotations obtained from the views in the theses examined regarding these findings are as follows:

"Students are more respectful to each other and to adults after values education (T10, p.67)." *"We also see that feelings of cooperation develop..... At school, we have students who are helpful to disabled students, share what they have with the others, have a habit of reading books, participate in artistic activities and respect diversity (T10, 71)."* *"After our practices for values education, I can say that there are some changes in students and I could observe them. For example, students who share their food with the ones who don't have food, students who give their notebooks to others who couldn't write the text on the board, students who confess their fault a result of misbehavior in the classroom, not lying etc. (T5, p.64)."*

CONCLUSION, DISCUSSION AND SUGGESTIONS

3 themes were created from the qualitative data of 24 postgraduate theses examined; Applications practiced to gain values education and problems encountered, The values that should be gained by the students according to the teachers and the factors effective in gaining these values, The problems that the values education can deliver solution and the behavioral changes observed in the students after the values education practices.

In the studies in which the opinions were taken in values education, it was found that mostly the opinions of the teachers were taken. However, it is thought that taking the opinions of the

academic staff in higher education institutions, especially in teacher training institutions, on this issue will be beneficial in developing the programs. Therefore, first it is recommended to evaluate the existing situation also from the point of view of the student and the lecturer, in order to improve the curriculum of the education faculties further. Also, considering the subjects of the postgraduate studies examined, it was determined that a limited number of studies were conducted on the views on teaching materials used and produced in values education. Thus, it is recommended to conduct more studies in which opinions are taken in order to improve the teaching materials and technologies used in values education.

According to the synthesis obtained as a result of the research, teachers stated that in values education practices, primarily drama was used and then case study and storytelling. It was stated that the least common practice was reading poems and books on values. It was determined that the least common activity was reading poems and books about values. Also in different studies where teachers' opinions about the application of values education were taken, it was determined that drama method is used in the first place in gaining values and that its use is effective in gaining values, embodies the learning process and provides a fun learning environment (Akıtırık and Bağçeli Kahraman, 2019; Akpınar and Özdaş, 2013; Balcı and Yanpar Yelken, 2013; Can Aran and Demirel, 2013; Çelik and Buluç, 2018; Gür et al., 2015; Kaya and Antepi, 2018; Kaya, Günay and Aydın, 2016; Kılıç, 2017; Meydan and Bahçe, 2010; Uzun and Köse, 2017). However, it should not be forgotten that teaching oral and written works at schools in addition to drama is important in cultural transfer. Especially literary texts are beneficial in terms of value explanation, value analysis, making a moral judgment and cultural transfer (Özdemir and İdi Tulumcu, 2017). On the other hand students can be gained values by making use of activities such as fairy tales, proverbs, folk songs and poems. It was stated that fairy tales are important in terms of the transmission, teaching and adoption of our traditions, national and sentimental values from generation to generation (Kahramanoğlu, 2019). For these reasons, it is recommended to examine the reflections of the poems of national and universal poets on the values education, and to read the books that include the life stories / achievements of the thinkers in value acquisition practices.

When the results regarding the problems encountered in values education applications are examined; it was observed that the fact that families do not contribute to the process is in the first place. The low number and variety of activities and materials in the values education program, crowded classes, negative examples presented by mass media, etc. problems follow this problem. In parallel with these findings, similar results have emerged in many studies in which problems encountered in values education practices were determined (Ağgöl Yalçın & Yalçın, 2018; Çelikkaya & Filoğlu, 2014; Ergin & Karataş, 2016; Erkuş & Yazar, 2013; Gömleksiz & Kılınç, 2015; Kurtulmuş, Tösten, & Günduş, 2014; Thornberg and Oğuz, 2013; Zurawsky, 2003). Based on the problem of the low number and variety of activities and materials, it is recommended to carry out studies to increase the effectiveness and variety of materials related to values education, and to evaluate and improve the results. At the same time, it is thought that giving regular seminars on values education to families and implementing practices that can involve the family may minimize the problem of family not contributing to the process.

According to teachers, it was determined that in the ranking of values that should be gained to students, the first place is respect, the second is honesty, and the third is responsibility and love. These values are followed by those values respectively; solidarity, tolerance, justice, empathy, patriotism, sharing, self-confidence, patience, conscience, solidarity and equality. In different studies about the values that should be gained according to teachers, especially the values of respect, responsibility and love were focused on. In different studies about the values that should be gained according to teachers, especially the values of respect, responsibility and love were focused on (Gömleksiz and Kılınç, 2015; Gür et al., 2015; Ogelman & Erten Sarıkaya, 2015; Oğuz, 2012; Yiğittir & Öcal, 2011). When these values are examined in an international context, it is observed that common values such as freedom, honesty, reliability and responsibility are included; however the values such as self-control, compassion, conscience and character education are less included (Bilici, 2018; Brady, 2008; Klaus

Ruhmer, 1990). However, in the postgraduate theses examined, teachers did not include the value of self-control among the values that should be gained. In fact, the self-control value includes many values such as controlling thoughts, emotions and behaviors, awareness and empathy. For this reason, it is recommended to make practices that provide self-control value and evaluate their results. It was seen that the family should be the right role model in the first place in the results of the factors that are effective in providing values education. This factor is followed by these factors; teacher's being the right model, the family's being consistent, school culture and mass media etc. In a study conducted by Özmen, Er, and Gürgil (2012), teachers stated that the approach of being a role model in the teaching of values is the most important and they use that. In a qualitative study conducted by Akpınar and Özdaş (2013), it was concluded that the school and the media, as well as the family, are an important factor in value education. Anderson et al. (2003) indicated that violent programs on various television and social media increased the tendency towards violent behavior among young people. In a study conducted by Yörük, Koçyiğit, and Turan (2015), TV series and computer games were grouped as violent and non-violent, and the drawings of secondary school students about TV series and computer games were analyzed within this framework. At the end of the analysis, it was determined that knives, guns, bullets, blood, dead and injured people were drawn in the pictures involving violence. Considering that factors such as social media, television series, television programs, YouTube phenomena, internet create serious problems in gaining values, it is recommended to increase the supervision of social media and mass media, and especially to organize and develop the contents of programs, series and cartoons in accordance with values education. For this, it is recommended to include an applied course in which participation can be provided to the curriculum, apart from the theoretical course, and where evaluations can be made by watching cartoons, short films and theaters. In addition, taking into consideration the positive results (Albayrak & Kartal, 2020; Coşkunserçe, 2020; Fariyatul Fayhuni and Bandonon, 2017; Karakuş, 2015; Kutlucan, Çakır and Ünal, 2019; Menendez-Ferreira et al., 2019; Rathore and Mishra, 2016; Yürük & Atıl, 2017), of the use of digital stories, animations, cartoons and video blogs on values education, it is recommended to frequently include such controlled practices.

As a result of the research, the teachers stated that they were of the opinion that values education could bring solution to injustice the most and then violence, lying and disrespect. At the same time, they expressed that they think that students' behaviors of being respectful, sharing and helping each other change positively with the values education provided in schools. Also in an experimental study conducted by Dereli İman (2014) in which the effects of the values education program on the psycho-social development of children were tested, it was determined that students who received values education developed the skills of controlling their anger behaviors, adapting to changes and self-control etc. In the two studies conducted by Dilmaç (2007), Tahiroğlu, Yıldırım and Çetin (2010), it was found that as a result of the practices of values education, it was concluded that the students' sensitivity towards the environment increased, their aggression tendency decreased and human values such as responsibility, respect, tolerance and honesty were gained. With the help of results and as the teachers mentioned, it is seen that the values education applications are effective to set aright students' habits and gaining the target values. With addition to these applications, it is advice to diversify values in terms of self-control and self-regulation, to review gains and prepare more effective instructional designs in between student-parents-teachers triangle with the help of guidance service.

REFERENCES

- Ağgül Yalçın, F. & Yalçın, M. (2018). Preschool teachers' views of preschool educational problems: Ağrı city sample. *Elementary Education Online*, 17(1), 367-383.
- Akıtürk, H.K. & Bağçeli Kahraman, P. (2019). Pre-school teacher candidates' views on values education. *Journal of Values Education*, 17(38), 267-294.

- Akpınar, B. & Özdaş, F. (2013). Teachers' views on value education at primary schools: a qualitative analysis. *Firat University Journal of International Social Sciences*, 23(2), 105-113.
- Aladağ, S. (2009). *The effect of values education approaches on students level of gaining responsibility value in primary school social studies education*. Unpublished Master's Thesis, Gazi University, Institute of Educational Science, Ankara.
- Albayrak, B.M. & Kartal, A. (2020). Animations in the context of values education: The Examination "Kung Fu Panda 3". *Journal of Turkish Education*, 5(2), 268-284.
- Anderson, C. A., Berkowitz, L., Donnerstein, E., Huesmann, L. R., Johnson, J. D., Linz, D., & Wartella, E. (2003), The influence of media violence on youth. *Psychological Science in the Public Interest*, 4(3), 81-110.
- Arthur, J. (2003). *Education with Character: The Moral Economy of Schooling*. London: Routledge Falmer.
- Aydemir Özbay, H. (2019). *Examining the effectiveness of sixth grade mathematics curriculum and responsibility value education program plan*. Unpublished Master's Thesis, Marmara University, Institute of Educational Science, İstanbul.
- Balcı, F.A. & Yanpar Yelken, T. (2013). Teachers' opinions about the values in primary education social studies curriculum and values education. *KEFAD*, 14(1), 195-213.
- Bilici, B. (2018). Values education in Germany: The case of lower Saxony. *Journal of Education in Muslim Societies and Communities*, 2(1), 127-147.
- Brady, L. (2008). Values education for Australian schools: A question of how. *Education and Society*, 26(2), 45-52.
- Cafoğlu, Z. & Somuncuoğlu, D. (2000). *Global Values in Education and Character Education* (Reports-Research). ERIC Number: ED449449.
- Can Aran, Ö. & Demirel, Ö. (2013). The opinions of 4th and 5th social science class teachers about values on educational practices. *Electronic Journal of Social Sciences*, 12(46), 151-168.
- Çelik, Ö. & Buluç, B. (2018). The application of creative drama method in values teaching through interdisciplinary approach. *Erzincan University Journal of Education Faculty*, 20(1), 67-88.
- Çelikkaya, T. & Filoğlu, S. (2014). Attitudes of social studies teachers toward value and values education. *Educational Sciences: Theory & Practice*, 14(4), 1541-1556.
- Coşkunserçe, O. (2020). Usage of video blog in values education. *Journal of Values Education*, 18(40), 307-343.
- Denner, J., Campe & S., Werner, L. (2019). Does computer game design and programming benefit children? A meta-synthesis of research. *ACM Transactions on Computing Education*, 19(3), 1-35.
- Dereli İman, E. (2014). The effect of the values education programme on 5.5-6 year old children's social development: Social skills, psycho-social development and social problem solving skills. *Educational Sciences: Theory & Practice*, 14(1), 249-268.
- Devos, T. Spini, D. & Schwartz, S.H. (2002). Conflicts among human values and trust in institutions. *British Journal of Social Psychology*, 41(4), 481-494.

- Dilmaç, B. (2007). *The assesment of the teaching of humane values which are imposed a group of science high school students by humane values scale*. Unpublished Doctoral Thesis, Selçuk University, Institute of Social Sciences, Konya.
- Ergin, E. & Karataş, S. (2016). Value education about the opinions of teachers: a case study. *JEDUS*, 2(2), 33-45.
- Erkuş, S. & Yazar, T. (2013). The evaluation the opinions of pre-school education teachers about the values education in pre-school education programme. *Dicle University Journal of Ziya Gökalp Education Faculty*, 20, 196-211.
- Fariyatul Fayhunu, E. & BAndono, A. (2017). The use of value clarification technique-based- picture story media as an alternative media to value education in primary school. *Harmonia: Journal of Arts Research and Education*, 17(1), 68-74.
- Genc, S. Z., & Eryaman, M. Y. (2008). Changing values and new education paradigm. *Journal of Social Sciences of the Afyon Kocatepe University*, 9(1), 89-102.
- Gömlüksiz, M.N. & Kılınç, H.H. (2015). The opinions, expectations and recommendations of middle school teachers about values education. *Social Science Studies*, 3(5), 35-45.
- Gür, Ç., Koçak, N., Şirin, N., Şafak, M. & Demircan, A. (2015). The study of elementary school teachers' views regarding values education and the difficulties they face: Ankara sample. *Asian Journal of Instruction*, 3(1), 78-91.
- Halstead J.M & Taylor M.J. (2000). Learning and teaching about values: a review of recent research. *Cambridge Journal of Education*, 30(2), 169–202.
- Halstead, J.M. (1996). Values and values education in schools. J. Mark Halstead ne Monica J. Taylor (Ed.), *Values and values education in schools within* (s.1-3). London: The Falmer Press.
- Hayta Önal, Ş. *The Effect of responsibility programme on to nineth class high school students*, Unpublished Master's Thesis, Uludağ University, Institute of Social Science, Bursa.
- Hermans, H.J.M & Oles, P.K. (1994). The personal meaning of values in a rapdly changing society. *The Journal of Social Psychology*, 134(5), 569-579.
- Izgar, G. *The effect to democratic manners and behaviors of values education programme which is applied on 8. grades students at the primary school*. Unpublished Doctoral Thesis Necmettin Erbakan University, Institute of Educational Science, Konya.
- İpekçi, S. (2018). *Analyse the effectiveness of the 6th grade math curriculum integrated values education programme draft*. Unpublished Master's Thesis, Marmara University, Institute of Educational Science, İstanbul.
- Kahramanoğlu, R. (2019). Türk Kültür Tarihinde ve Türkiye’de Deeğerler Eğitimi. Özer, B. (Ed.), *Karakter ve Değerler Eğitimi* içinde (96-117). Pegem Akademi, Ankara
- Karakuş, N. (2015). Evaluating the cartoons that appeal to preschool age in terms of their contribution into the values education (The Niloya Case). *Journal of Values Education*, 13(30), 251-277.
- Kaşkaya, A. & Duran, T. (2017). Investigation of primary school Turkish textbooks in terms of the value transfer. *Trakya University Journal of Education*, 7(2), 417-441.

- Kaya, Y. & Antepli, S. (2018). The values education in preschool period through creative drama. *Creative Drama Journal*, 13(2), 237-250.
- Kaya, Y., Günay, R. & Aydın, H. (2016). The effects of values education courses through with drama techniques in the student awareness levels in the preschool education. *Sakarya University Journal of Education*, 6(1), 23-38.
- Kılıç, Z. (2017). *The effect of the activities based on creative drama on 60 - 66 months children for gaining them values*. Unpublished Master's Thesis, Recep Tayyip Erdoğan University, Institute of Social Sciences, Rize.
- Klaus Luhmer, SJ. (1990). Moral education in Japan. *Journal of Moral Education*, 19(3), 172-181.
- Kunduroğlu, T. (2010). *The effectiveness of 'values education' program integrated with the 4th grade science and technology instructional program*. Unpublished Master's Thesis, Ankara University, Institute of Educational Sciences, Ankara.
- Kurtulmuş, M., Tösten, T. & Gündaş, A. (2014). The problems encountered by the first stage elementary school teachers in the process of value education. *Journal of Values Education*, 12(27), 281-305.
- Kutlucan, E., Çakır, R. & Ünal, Y. (2019). An action research for the value education provided with digital storytelling. *Kastamonu Education Journal*, 27(5), 2187-2202.
- Lachal, J., Revah-Levy, A., Orri, M. & Moro, M. R. (2017). Metasynthesis: An original Method to synthesize Qualitative Literature in Psychiatry. *Frontiers in Psychiatry*, 8(269), 1-9.
- Lockwood, A. L. (2009). *The case for character education: A developmental approach*. New York, NY: Teachers College Press.
- Major, C.H. & Savin-Baden, M. (2010). *An Introduction to Qualitative Research Synthesis Managing the Information Explosion in Social Science Research*. Routledge: Oxon Hill United Kingdom.
- MEB (2010). Values Education Directive. Retrieved 13 September, 2020, http://mebk12.meb.gov.tr/meb_iys_dosyalar/34/39/749197/dosyalar/2015_02/09093609_deg erleregiti mi.pdf.
- Menendez-Ferreira, R., Gonzalez-Pardo, A., Ruiz Barquín, R., Maldonado, A. & Camacho, D. (2019). Design of a software system to support value education in sports through gamification techniques. *Vietnam Journal of Computer Science*, 6(1), 57-67.
- Meydan, A. & Bahçe, A. (2010). In science of life teaching evaluation of make gaining values level according to teacher's views. *International Journal of Eurasia Social Sciences*, 1(1), 20-37.
- Miles, M. B. & Huberman, A.M. (1994). *Qualitative Data Analysis: An Expanded Sourcebook*. (2nd Edition). Calif. : SAGE Publications.
- Mueller, D.J. & Wornhoff, S.A. (1990). Distinguishing personal and social values. *Educational and Psychological Measurement*, 1(50), 691-699.
- Ogelman, H.G. & Erten Sarıkaya, H. (2015). Views of preschool teachers about education of values: case of Denizli province. *Sakarya University Journal of Education Faculty*, 29, 81-100.

- Oğuz, E. (2012). Views of pre-service teachers on values and value education. *Educational Sciences: Theory & Practice*, 12(2), 1309-1325.
- Osterman, K.F. (2000). Students' need for belonging in the school community. *Review of Educational Research*, 70, 323-367.
- Öğretici, B. (2011). *Research of the effectuality of implementations towards the education of values in social studies lessons of the primary education 6th grade*. Unpublished Master's Thesis, Sakarya University, Institute of Educational Sciences, Sakarya.
- Özdemir, M. & İdi Tulumcu, F. (2017). Utilization of literary texts in values education: The sample of Muhadarat by Fatma Aliye. *Sakarya University Journal of Education*, 7(4), 720-729.
- Özkan, R. (2010). Protectionist values in Turkish education system: sample primary education course book. *International Journal of Human Sciences*, 7(1), 1124-1141.
- Özmen, C., Er, H. & Gürgil, F. (2012). A research for elementary school teachers' opinions about value education. *Mustafa Kemal University Journal of Social Sciences*, 9(17), 297-311.
- Paterson, B., Thorne, S., Canam, C. & Jillings C. (2001). *Meta-Study of Qualitative Health Research A practical Guide to Meta-Analysis and Meta-Synthesis*. Sage Publications International Educational and Professional Publisher, Thousand Oaks London New Delhi.
- Rathore, M. & Mishra, R.R. (2016). Value education through Indian animation stories and its impact on life skills and gender equity of school going adolescents of other backward classes. *International Journal of Advances in Social Sciences and Humanities*, 4(5), 60-65.
- Schwartz, S. H. (1994). Are there universal aspects in the structure and contents of human values? *Journal of Social Issues*, 4, 19-45.
- Smart, J. C., (2004). *Higher Education: Handbook of theory and research*, London: Kluwer Academic Publishers.
- Spini, D. (2003). Measurement equivalence of 10 value types from the Schwartz value survey across 21 countries. *Journal of Cross-Cultural Psychology*, 34(1), 3-23.
- Tahiroğlu, M., Yıldırım, T. & Çetin, T. (2010). The effects of environmental education activities based on value education on 7th grade students' attitudes toward environment. *Journal of Ahmet Keleşoğlu Education Faculty*, 30, 231-248.
- Tannenbaum, M. B., Hepler, J., Zimmerman, R. S., Saul, L., Jacobs, S., Wilson, K., & Albarracín, D. (2015). Appealing to fear: A meta-analysis of fear appeal effectiveness and theories. *Psychological Bulletin*, 141(6), 1178-1204.
- Thornberg, R. & Oğuz, E. (2013). Teachers' views on values education: A qualitative study in Sweden and Turkey. *International Journal of Educational Research*, 59, 49-56.
- Topal, Y. (2019). Values education and ten root value. *Mavi Atlas*, 7(1), 245-254.
- Ulusoy, K. & Dilmaç, B. (2015). *Değerler Eğitimi*. Ankara: Pegem Akademi.
- Uzun, M. & Köse, A. (2017). Teachers' opinions about the application of values education during preschool education. *Journal of Bayburt Education Faculty*, 12(23), 305-338.
- Venkataiah, N. (2007). *Value Education*. New Delhi: APH Publishing Corporation.

- Yıldırım, A. & Şimşek, H. (2005). *Sosyal Bilimlerde Nitel Araştırma Yöntemleri*. Ankara: Seçkin Yayıncılık.
- Yiğittir, S. & Öcal, A. (2011). High school history teachers' views on values and values education. *The Journal of Social and Economic Research*, 13(20), 117-124.
- Yörük, S. , Koçyiğit, M. & Turan, M. (2015). The effect of TV series and computer games on the perceptions of violence of secondary school students a qualitative study. *Uşak University Journal of Social Sciences*, 8(4), 127-142.
- Yürük, S.E. & Atıcı, B.(2017). The effect of digital story based values education materials on students' value acquisition. *Trakya University Journal of Educational Sciences*, 7(1), 56-74.
- Zurawsky, C. (2003). *Class Size: Research Points*. American Educational Research Association, Washington: DC.

Theses Examined in Meta Synthesis Study

- Abukan, F. (2019). *Awareness Level Of Teachers In Regards To Values Education And Their Thoughts About Material-Building School Policy*. Unpublished Master's Thesis, Amasya University, Institute of Social Sciences, Amasya. (T14)
- Acur, E. (2019). *The Evaluation Of Values Education Practices In Presidency Of Religious Affairs 4-6 Years Quran Courses In The Context Of Teachers' Views*. Unpublished Master's Thesis, Sakarya University, Institute of Education Science, Sakarya. (T18)
- Ateş, F. (2013). *It's Qualitative Study Including Opinions Of The Primary And Secondary School Teachers About Training Of Values And It's Implementati*. Unpublished Master's Thesis, Yeditepe University, Institute of Social Sciences, İstanbul. (T1)
- Aydın, H. (2019). *Examination Of Geography Coursebooks In Terms Of Values Education Approaches And Opinions Of Geography Teachers About Values Education*. Unpublished Master's Thesis, Çanakkale Onsekiz Mart University, Institute of Education Science, Çanakkale. (T21)
- Aydın, M. (2019). *Classroom Teachers' Views On Values Education (Isparta Province Example)*. Unpublished Master's Thesis, Burdur Mehmet Akif University, Institute of Education Science, Burdur. (T20)
- Baltacı, N.B. (2018). *Views Of Middle School Administrators About Teaching Values*. Unpublished Master's Thesis, Maltepe University, Institute of Social Sciences, İstanbul. (T10)
- Bartan, S. (2018). *Evaluation Of Pre-School Teachers Opinions About The Values And Values Education And Classroom Practices Of Values Education*. Unpublished Master's Thesis, Kütahya Dumlupınar University, Institute of Education Science, Kütahya. (T11)
- Baydır, E. (2018). *English Teachers' Views On Education And Practice Of Values In The 2017 Draft English Curriculum*. Unpublished Master's Thesis, Osmangazi University, Institute of Education Science, Eskişehir. (T6)
- Boydak, K. (2019). *Evaluation Of The Practices Of Values Education Conducted At Private High Schools According To The Opinions Of Teachers And Students (The Case Of Kayseri)*. Unpublished Master's Thesis, Erciyes University, Institute of Social Sciences, Kayseri. (T13)

- Çetin Korkmaz, M. (2019). *Investigation Of Preschool Education Teachers Opinions Concerning Values Education*. Unpublished Master's Thesis, Kahramanmaraş Sütçü İmam University, Institute of Social Sciences, Kahramanmaraş. (T2)
- Derse, G.E. (2019). *Examination Of The Texts In 6th Grade Turkish Coursebooks In Terms Of Values Education And Evaluation In Context Of Teachers Opinions*. Unpublished Master's Thesis, Yüzüncü Yıl University, Institute of Education Science, Van. (T17)
- Eren, E. (2018). *The Evaluation Of Values Education According To The Preschool Education Program, The Views And Practices Of Preschool Teachers And Families*. Unpublished Master's Thesis, Abant İzzet Baysal University, Institute of Education Science, Bolu. (T9)
- Erkuş, S. (2012). *The Evaluate The Opinions Of Pre-School Education Teachers About The Values Education In Pre-School Education*. Unpublished Master's Thesis, Dicle University, Institute of Education Science, Diyarbakır. (T3)
- Gözel, Ü. (2018). *An Evaluation Of Teacher Opinion Of Values Education With The Social Science Course Curriculum*. Unpublished Master's Thesis, Adnan Menderes University, Institute of Social Sciences, Aydın. (T8)
- Karaca, A.S. (2020). *The Examination Of Values Education Applied To Pra 4-6 Age Quran Course Students In Terms Of Tutorial Views*. Unpublished Master's Thesis, Necmettin Erbakan University Institute of Social Sciences, Konya. (T23)
- Kuzu, K. (2015). *The Opinions Of Pre-School Teachers Related To The Value Education And The Reflection Of Those Opinions On In-Class Practices*. Unpublished Master's Thesis, Uludağ University Institute of Educational Sciences, Bursa. (T4)
- Özlemiş, N. (2019). *Research Of Teachers' Views On Value Education Implementations In The Scope Of Primary School Social Studies*. Unpublished Master's Thesis, Marmara University Institute of Educational Sciences, İstanbul. (T15)
- Şentürk, G. (2019). *Teachers' Views On The Applicability Of Value Education In Science Course*. Unpublished Master's Thesis, Yıldız Technical University, Institute of Graduate School of Science and Engineering, İstanbul. (T22)
- Taymur, N. (2019). *Teachers' Views On The Effect Of The Updated Visual Arts Curriculum In Teaching The Concepts Of Value Education*. Unpublished Master's Thesis, Dumlupınar University, Institute of Social Sciences, Kütahya. (T24)
- Kınacı, M.K. (2018). *The Views Of Pre-Service Social Studies Teachers On Values Education And Values Included In Social Studies Curriculum*. Unpublished Master's Thesis, Fırat University, Institute of Educational Sciences, Elazığ. (T7)
- Taymur, Z. A. (2015). *Primary Teachers' Views On Qualitative Research Value For Education And Practice Batman Sample*. Unpublished Master's Thesis, Zirve University Kahramanmaraş Sütçü İmam University, Institute of Social Sciences, Gaziantep. (T5)
- Turgut Yıldırım, D. (2019). *Evaluation Of Values Education In The Case Of Gifted Students According To The Opinions Of Teachers And Administrators*. Unpublished Master's Thesis, İnönü University, Institute of Educational Sciences, Malatya. (T16)

Uzuner, N.K. (2019). *Opinions Of Primary School Teachers About Materials And Equipment Used In Education Of Values*. Unpublished Master's Thesis, Sakarya University. Institute of Educational Sciences, Sakarya. (T12)

Yalçın, M. (2019). *Teacher Opinions About Values Education In Changed (2017) Social Sciences Curriculum (Sivas Example)*. Unpublished Master's Thesis, Binali, Yıldırım University, Institute of Social Sciences, Erzincan. (T19)