

## **Identifying the Values to be acquired by the Students in Inclusive Classrooms based on the Views of the Classroom Teachers**

**Tansel Yazıcıoğlu<sup>i</sup>**

Nevşehir Hacı Bektaş Veli University

**Vedat Aktepe<sup>ii</sup>**

Nevşehir Hacı Bektaş Veli University

### **Abstract**

The general goal of special education and inclusive education is to socialize students. Socialization refers to individuals' attempts to participate in their immediate environment through the acquisition of certain knowledge, skills, values and behaviors. The basis of socialization in formal education systems is the educational programs and particularly, the educational program of social studies courses. Identifying which of values contained in the educational programs should be taught to students is very significant to reevaluate these values and to allow classroom teachers to develop common values for inclusive classrooms. The study aims at identifying the values to be acquired by students in inclusive classrooms. The participants of the study are primary school teachers who work at primary schools in Nevşehir province of Turkey. In the study, qualitative method was used, and the data were collected through semi-structured interview questions and analyzed by content analysis technique by using inductive approach. The findings of the research show that the most frequently cited value for the students with no special education is empathy. The findings of the research also show that the participants mostly employ individual study in value education in the context of inclusive education.

**Keyword:** Human Values Empathy, Individual Study, Inclusive Classes

**DOI:** 10.29329/ijpe.2022.426.4

---

<sup>i</sup> **Tansel Yazıcıoğlu**, Assist. Prof. Dr., Special Education, Nevşehir Hacı Bektaş Veli University, ORCID: 0000-0002-0946-2637

**Correspondence:** tanselyazicioglu@gmail.com

<sup>ii</sup> **Vedat Aktepe**, Assoc. Prof., Basic Education, Nevşehir Hacı Bektaş Veli University, ORCID: 0000-0001-5259-9340

## INTRODUCTION

Inclusive education refers to an educational process which enables students with special needs to participate in learning environment and therefore, classroom setting reducing their exclusion and which meets the needs of all students. This process includes educating all children in the appropriate age range with a shared vision under the responsibility of the general education system, adaptation and changes in course contents, teaching and learning approaches, structures and strategies (United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization [UNESCO], 2005). Through this approach students with special needs are offered the same teaching and learning opportunities which are also provided to their peers in the same educational settings. Therefore, all these students share their experiences with one another and learn something from one another (Frankel, 2004). Such exchanges of experiences are mostly about the values of individuals and society. In Turkish dictionary (2011) the word value refers to the material and spiritual elements containing social, cultural, economical and scientific values that a nation has. Aktepe (2019) states that the goal of value education is to transform the accepted values into knowledge, skills and behaviors among individuals. In addition in value education it is aimed to contribute to the development of the personality development and humanistic characteristics of the individuals, to help them to be in harmony with themselves and society and to ensure that they are raised as good people in the light of moral values. Therefore, values should also be taught in inclusive classroom to improve the social development, affective and cognitive development of students with special needs. In other words, value education in inclusive classrooms should be given importance.

Inclusive education has also significant effects on students with no special needs. One of such effects is the change in their perspectives. Through such perspective changes their attitudes towards inclusive students become much more positive as a result of the elimination of bias. In addition, students with no special needs learn to be tolerant towards inclusive students, to be helpful and to share (Acarlar, 2016; Campbell, Gilmore & Cuskelly, 2003; Hayward, 2006). The general goal of special education and inclusive education is to socialize students. Socialization refers to individuals' attempts to participate in their immediate environment through the acquisition of certain knowledge, skills, values and behaviors (Ozpolat, 2009). The basis of socialization in formal education systems is the educational programs and particularly, the educational program of social studies courses (Ozmen, 2009). Such courses at the primary education are social studies and life sciences. The educational programs of these courses in 2015 (Ministry of National Education, [MONE], 2015a, 2015b) and the latest educational programs (MONE, 2018a; 2018b) include thirty-three values as reported by Aktepe and Gunduz (2019). These values are as follows: fairness, attaching importance to family unity, modesty, independency, peace, scientificness, generosity, diligence, solidarity, friendship, sensitivity, honesty, empathy, aesthetics, equality, sacrifice, tolerance, mercy, hospitality, freedom, self-control, self-confidence, self-respect, sharing, patience, respect, love, responsibility, savings, cleanliness, patriotism, fidelity and helpfulness. Aktepe and Gunduz (2019) categorize the values in the following groups: national values, religious values, universal values, human values, individual values and social values. Identifying which of these values contained in the educational programs should be taught to inclusive students is very significant to reevaluate these values and to allow classroom teachers to develop common values for inclusive classrooms. For instance, Esmer, Yilmaz, Gunes, Tarim & Delican (2017) conclude that inclusive students experience some problems such as shyness, exclusion and peer pressure.

Research indicate that although inclusive students attend the classes they cannot achieve socialization and cannot improve their communicative skills and also, have underachievement and various problems (Gresham, 1986; Guralnick, 1990; Kabasakal, Girli, Okun, Celik & Vardarli, 2008; Myles, 2003; Wang, 2009; Zirpoli & Melloy, 1997). The goal of inclusive education is to improve the social and personal development of students and make them an integrated part of the society. Therefore, the following question should be answered: Which values should inclusive students acquire to increase their academic success and not to experience social problems? There is no study directly dealing with these values that inclusive students should acquire. However, there are some studies

which analyse the problems that students with special needs come across and the empathy levels of the students in inclusive classrooms (Sahin, 2010; Bahar, 2018).

Based on the data of the MONE during the school year 2018-2019 there were 116.816 inclusive students, and 1.260 were attending pre-school institutions and 115.556 primary schools (MONE, 2019). Thus, it shows that classroom teachers may teach inclusive students. Therefore, it is significant to identify which values should be acquired by the students in inclusive classrooms. Such an information will contribute to the educational programs and improve the student achievement in inclusive education settings. The study aims at identifying the values to be acquired by students in inclusive classrooms. In line with this aim the study attempts to answer the following research questions:

1. What are the values to be acquired by the students in inclusive classrooms?
2. How can these values be categorized?
3. What are the reasons for the acquisition of these values by the students in inclusive classrooms?
4. Which teaching and learning methods and techniques are used in value education in such educational settings?

## **METHOD**

### **Design of the study**

This study was designed with the case study design out of qualitative research approaches aimed at providing the researcher with detailed and in-depth data collection, direct learning of the participants' individual perceptions, experiences and perspectives, and understanding and explaining the current situations (Patton, 2014). Case study analyzes one or more cases in a holistic way with factors such as environment, time, individual, event, and process. Since the situations are different, there are no generalizations of the results. However, it is expected that the results obtained in relation to a situation have been formed by examples and experiences for understanding similar situations (Yildirim & Simsek, 2018).

### **Participants**

The participants of the study are primary school teachers who work at primary schools in Nevşehir province of Turkey. The participants worked at criterion sampling, which is one of the purposive sampling methods, was used to collect the qualitative data of the study. Criteria used to identify the participants are as follows: (1) being a classroom teacher, (2) having at least five years teaching experience, (3) teaching at least one inclusive student and (4) teaching inclusive students at least for one semester. All school administrators were called with phone to see whether or not any inclusive student was at school. In order to select the participants of the qualitative part of the study seven public primary schools in Nevşehir province were visited and information about the eligible classroom teachers was taken from the school administrators. Then interviews were made with these teachers and at the end seven teachers accepted to take part in the study. Of them one is male and six are female.

### **Data collection tool**

The data of the study were collected through the interviews. Interview items were developed based on the review of the related studies. A total of four items were developed for the interviews. These items were reviewed by four field experts (two experts with PhD in classroom teaching and two experts with PhD in special education). Based on the expert feedback the items were modified. In order to establish the intelligibility of the interview items a pilot study was conducted with two

classroom teachers. The feedback from these two participants showed that items are sufficiently understandable.

### Data analysis

The study was carried out in Nevşehir province during the school year of 2019-2020. The data of the study were collected between 6 and 27 January 2020. The data of the study were collected through interviews with seven classroom teachers. Although seven classroom teachers reported that they could participate in the interviews, later one of them declined to participate in the interview. The items were sent to her and she replied them through an email message. The answers of six participants to the interview items were recorded. The interview data were transcribed and produced eighteen-page data.

Content analysis was used to examine the qualitative data. In content analysis the data are conceptualized and these concepts are organized to have themes which account for the data (Yildirim & Simsek, 2018). In the study first interview data were transcribed. In order to establish the reliability of the study five transcribed recordings which were randomly selected were reviewed by an expert on special education. Then the codes were developed and then, these codes were categorized based on the themes. The themes were further divided into subthemes. Codes and themes were reviewed by two experts one who was a special education expert and the other one was an expert on value education. Three themes and seventeen subthemes were developed for which mutual agreement was achieved.

## FINDINGS

The themes developed based on the analysis of the interview data are given in Table 1, Table 2 and Table 3.

**Table 1. Values to be acquired by the students in the inclusive classes**

| Subthemes        | Codes                         | Quotations  | Teacher codes  | N |
|------------------|-------------------------------|---|----------------|---|
| Human values     | Empathy                       | K4: "Of these values the most significant one for me is empathy.."  | K3, K4, K5, K8 | 4 |
|                  | Helpfulness                   | K2: "I generally want students in my classroom, to be tolerant, respectful and helpful ..."   | K2, K3, K8     | 3 |
|                  | Sharing                       | K7: "Acting independently, solidarity and self-confidence and sharing, independence ..."  | K2, K7, K8     | 3 |
|                  | Tolerance                     | K2: "I generally want students in my classroom, to be tolerant, respectful and helpful ..."   | K2, K5         | 2 |
|                  | Sensitivity                   | K5: "Empathy, sensitivity, tolerance compassion, patience, sacrifice. I think that students should acquire these values."                                   | K3, K5         | 2 |
|                  | Mercy                         | K8: "Students need to acquire the values of empathy, justice, sharing and solidarity, compassion, love and respect."  | K5, K8         | 2 |
|                  | Devotion                      | K5: "I think that students need to acquire the values of empathy, sensitivity, tolerance compassion, patience, devotion."                                   | K5             | 1 |
| Universal values | Affection                     | K3: "For me the first one is respect. Then empathy, respect for differences, sensitivity, affection, helpfulness."  | K3, K4, K8     | 3 |
|                  | Fairness                      | K4: "Of these values the most significant ones are empathy, fairness and solidarity. For me these three values are extremely significant."                  | K4, K6, K8     | 3 |
|                  | Responsibility                | K8: "Inclusive students should acquire the values of self-confidence, self-expression, self-esteem, responsibility."  | K2, K4, K8     | 3 |
|                  | Respect                       | K3: "For me the first one is respect. Then empathy, respect for differences, sensitivity, affection, helpfulness."  | K2, K3, K8     | 3 |
|                  | Respect for differences       | K3: "For me the first one is respect. Then empathy, respect for differences, sensitivity, affection, helpfulness."  | K2, K3         | 2 |
|                  | Respect for national heritage | K2: "I want to raise students that respect for their cultural heritage, develop a self-identity, think through interpretation and not judge their friends." | K2             | 1 |

|                   |                 |  |            |   |
|-------------------|-----------------|--|------------|---|
| Individual values | Self-confidence | K8: "Inclusive students should acquire the values of self-confidence, self-expression, self-esteem, responsibility."                       | K2, K7, K8 | 3 |
|                   | Self-esteem     | K8: "Inclusive students should acquire the values of self-confidence, self-expression, self-esteem, responsibility."                       | K8         | 1 |
| Social values     | Solidarity      | K4: "Of these values the most significant ones are empathy, fairness and solidarity. For me these three values are extremely significant." | K4, K7     | 2 |
|                   | Diligence       | K6: "Diligence is also valued in society, it should be acquired by the students."  | K6         | 1 |
| National values   | Independence    | K7: "Acting independently, solidarity, self-confidence and sharing, independence ...."   | K7         | 1 |
| Religious values  | Patience        | K5: "Empathy, sensitivity, tolerance compassion, patience, sacrifice. I think that students should acquire these values."                  | K5         | 1 |

As can be seen in Table 1 the values emphasized by the participants to be acquired by the students in inclusive classrooms are classified into several categories. They mostly emphasized the human and universal values and less emphasized the national and religious values. Table 1 shows that they preferred the following human values as the necessary skills for the students: empathy (4), helpfulness (3), sharing (3), tolerance (2), sensitivity (2), compassion (2) and sacrifice (1). They mostly mentioned the following universal values: affection (3), justice (3), responsibility (3), respect (3), respect for differences (2) and respect for cultural heritage (1). The mostly cited social values are self-confidence (3) and self-esteem (1). They emphasized the social values of solidarity (2) and diligence (1). The most cited national value is independence (1) and the most cited religious value is found to be patience (1).

**Table 2. Reasons for the acquisition of the values by the students in inclusive classes**

| Subthemes  | Codes   | Quotations   | Teacher codes      | N |
|--|---|--|--------------------|---|
| Expected behaviors from students with no special needs | Empathy   | K5: "Empathy, it is very important to be able to think the situation of the others. Then I think they will understand better the situation their friends. "  | K3, K4, K5, K6, K8 | 5 |
|  | Being respectful to differences                                   | K2: "As long as these children are tolerated more and being respectful for different thoughts, I believe that these inclusive students will be more comfortable in classrooms. But respect for differences must, of course, be effectively given in every class."        | K2, K3, K4         | 3 |
|  | Respect   | K3: "When the inclusive student do or say something funny they do not laugh at him, they aware of the fact that he is like them. If they do not respect for their friend, it makes me angry."  | K3, K6, K8         | 3 |
|  | Being aware of some restrictions of the inclusive students        | K3: "For instance, sensitivity, instead of complaining about the inclusive students, they now understand these students."  | K3, K4             | 2 |
|  | Sensitiveness   | K4: "Solidarity, I said solidarity, it is needed to help other children who are already troubled, to make other children be more sensitive to them in order to solve their problems better."   | K4, K5             | 2 |
|  | Being tolerant  | K3: "...I don't know what would be if they are in a different class or if they had different people, but my students at least make more effort. "  | K3, K5             | 2 |
|  | Acceptance  | K3: "My students accepted their inclusive friend. They love him and do not have any problem with him."   | K3, K5             | 2 |
|  | Being merciful  | K5: "Being merciful is very important. This value should be acquired by all students. The feeling of compassion is a must for every student, but I think it is more important in such situations. So I think it's more important."                                       | K5, K8             | 2 |
|  | Being devoted   | K5: "I want them to make sacrifices, they have to sacrifice some things. For example, our inclusive student can do something different in the middle of the lesson. So this means that the students have to sacrifice their lesson, even a minute or two at the moment." | K5                 | 1 |
|  | Being compassionate   | K3: "...When the others are uncomfortable due to the behavior of the inclusive student, they at least try to understand him. So they are compassionate towards him. "  | K3                 | 1 |
| Not to mock  | K3: "When the inclusive student do or say something funny they do | K3   | 1                  |   |

|  |                                  |  |                |   |
|--|----------------------------------|--|----------------|---|
|  |                                  | not laugh at him, they aware of the fact that he is like them. They begin to understand him.”  |                |   |
| Values to be acquired by the students with special needs | Improving self-confidence        | K7: “Inclusive students have underdeveloped self-confidence. In other words, they think that they cannot do or achieve something. I do not know why they think like that. I do not know if his mother or father has any influence on this. But their self-confidence is low. In short, they do not see the power they can do something in themselves.” | K7, K8         | 2 |
|  | Having a sense of responsibility | K4: “I think they can work a little harder and be more academically successful if they can take responsibility who have problems in the inclusive classrooms. “  | K4             | 1 |
|  | Effective communication          | K8: “Inclusive students must express themselves without embarrassment and shame in society. To express their feelings and thoughts comfortably in front of the society, they must have the values of both self-confidence and self-expression. “   | K8             | 1 |
|  | Improving the tendency to share  | K7: “I observe that inclusive students experience difficulty in solidarity and sharing. They are very fond of their belongings, or they cannot tolerate scratching the edge or losing something. So sharing and solidarity is the deficiency I have seen in these children.”   | K7             | 1 |
|  | Being independent                | K7: “Because inclusive students cannot act independently. They are very fond of their mothers or always have to get help from someone. I think these children should stand on their own feet.”   | K7             | 1 |
| Values to be acquired by all students                    | Requirements of daily life       | K7: “These qualities must be present for social cohesion or to live happily in society. “  | K2, K3, K6, K7 | 4 |
|  | Being helpful                    | K4: “I emphasized the value of solidarity in order to help other children who are problematic, so that other children behave a little more sensitive to them in order to solve their problems better.”   | K4, K7, K8     | 3 |
|  | Changing perspectives            | K2: “Because when children respect each other, when they are tolerant, they look at the world with a lot of tolerance. “   | K2, K4         | 2 |
|  | Solving daily life problems      | K4: “Now they can more easily solve their problems with other children. - this is valid for all children. - Anyway, when such a problem arises, a method I use for all children from time to time to gain these values.“   | K4             | 1 |
| Expected behaviors from classroom teachers               | Positive approach                | K6: “...For example, I support him by saying "It was very beautiful!" even if he does not do anything related to the activity...”  | K4, K6         | 2 |
| Significance for society                                 | Being basis for the society      | K2: “I emphasized these values, since these are the basis of the society.”   | K2             | 1 |

Table 2 shows that the reasons for the acquisition the of values by the students are categorized into several groups: for the students with no special education needs, for the students with special education needs, for all students and for the classroom teachers. There is only one reason in relation to the significance for society. The reasons for the acquisition the of values by the students with no special education needs are as follows: empathy (5), being respectful for differences (3), respect (3), being merciful (2), being devoted (1), being compassionate (1) and not to mock (1). The reasons for the acquisition the of values by the students with no special education needs are as follows: improving the self-confidence (2), improving the sense of responsibility (1), effective communication (1), improving sense of sharing (1) and being independent (1).

The reasons for the acquisition the of values by all students are as follows: requirements of daily life (4), being helpful (3), changing perspectives (2) and solving the daily life problems (1). The reason for the acquisition the of values by the classroom teachers is as follows: being positive (2). The reasons for the acquisition the of values due to the significance for society is as follows: being basis for the society (1).

**Table 3. Methods and Techniques Used for Value Education in Inclusive Classes**

| Subthemes                        | Codes  | Quotations  | Teacher codes  | N |
|----------------------------------|--|---|----------------|---|
| Using individual work techniques | Assignings tasks   | K7: "A good example for is that my students record a classroom notebook. For instance, handwriting of the inclusive student was not so nice before. When he wrote down nice, I showed it to the class telling "Look he wrote down very nice.". Now one of the nicest notebook belongs to him. " | K2, K4, K7     | 3 |
|                                  | Assigning homework   | K2: "He perceives the things differently, so I assign him different homework that he could do to support his self-confidence. "   | K2, K6         | 2 |
|                                  | Practices  | K4: "...I try to make him gain these values by explaining it verbally and making practices."  | K4, K7         | 2 |
|                                  | Learning by doinge   | K2: "I generally follow the principle of learning by doing or I assign him tasks if he is active."  | K2, K4         | 2 |
|                                  | Visuals  | K2: "...If the student can comprehend the visuals I use these visuals."   | K2             | 1 |
|                                  | Drawing pictures about the topic   | K2: "I usually want the students to draw pictures about the related subjects."  | K2             | 1 |
|                                  | Poems or essays about the topic  | K2: "In this way, I present the values in the classroom through poems about those topics, articles that indicate the meaning and importance of the subject and special days and weeks in the class."  | K2             | 1 |
|                                  | Repetition   | K2: "I generally use repetition for such students, the experience of the students shed light on my choice over the techniques. "  | K2             | 1 |
| Using technology                 | K2: "The inclusive student is interested in technological devices. Given that such devices make students much more motivated visually we use such devices in the classroom." | K2  | 1              |   |
| Case studies                     | Experiences  | K2: "I generally use repetition for such students, the experience of the students shed light on my choice over the techniques. "  | K2, K4, K6, K7 | 4 |
|                                  | Case study   | K8: "I employ the case study, drama, problem solving methods. "   | K2, K6, K8     | 3 |
|                                  | Using sample texts   | K5: "For instance, I use fairy tales or stories which include these issues (patience) - we have story books on this subject - I read these texts, give them examples and share them with my students."  | K5             | 1 |
| Drama methods                    | Drama  | K8: "I employ the case study, drama, problem solving methods."  | K3, K6, K8     | 3 |
|                                  | Concretisation   | K6: "I use drama to make the topics much more concrete..."  | K6             | 1 |
| Rol-playing techniques           | Animation  | K7: "I try to participate him more in activities such as storytelling or animation."  | K7             | 1 |
|                                  | Story telling  | K7: "I try to participate him more in activities such as storytelling or animation."  | K7             | 1 |
|                                  | Gamification   | K7: "For instance, we play games or use play dough: Then I tell them that 'come here and make a thing with it.'" I also tell them "make decision over what to do with it."  | K7             | 1 |
|                                  | Being a model  | K5: "Children imitiate you (teachers). We are models for them. They imitiate me. So I tolerate them and be patient to them. Students see my behaviors. So they imitiate us. Not to be angry at the mistakes he made and by being more tolerant. They see us. "                                  | K5             | 1 |
| Lecture methods                  | Lectures   | K3: "I just lecture in the process. "   | K3, K4, K5     | 3 |
| Question-answer pairs            | Asking questions   | K6: "I use question-answer pairs. I ask questions and want them to answer these questions."   | K6             | 1 |

Table 3 indicates that the participants mostly employ individual study in value education in the context of inclusive education. They are found to less use lectures and question-answer pairs for this purpose. Table 3 also show the other methods and techniques used by the participant to teach the values in inclusive classrooms: case studies, drama and role-playing. Under the category of individual study the participants preferred the following: assigning tasks (3), assigning homework (2), practices (2), learning by doing (2), using visuals (1), drawing pictures about the topic (1), writing poems and essays about the topic (1), repetition (1) and using technology (1). Under the category of case study they reported that they used experiences (4), analysis of cases (3) and using sample texts (1). Under the category of drama techniques they used drama (3) and concretization (1). Under the category of

role-playing they used animation (1), storytelling (1), gamification (1) and being a model (1). They also reported to use lectures (3) and question-answer pairs (1).

## DICUSSION AND CONCLUSION

The participants generally reported that students should first acquire human values and then, universal rights. This finding of the study shows that social aspects of education are taken into consideration in inclusive classes and also, an understanding based on human rights is adopted. It is satisfying and acceptable. Indeed, inclusive education is generally accepted as a multi-dimensional concept and is a socio-political education model that includes values such as human rights, social justice and social equality. It also contains the dimensions of access to education, educational rights and transition to formal education (Kozleski, Artiles and Waitoller, 2011; Loreman, Deppeler, and Harvey, 2011; Mitchell, 2005; Slee, 2011; Smith, 2010; Topping, 2012). For this reason, emphasizing the human values is an approach that overlaps with the philosophy of inclusive education.

When the findings of the study on universal values are evaluated, it is seen that values such as fairness, affection, responsibility and respect come to the fore. According to Gurgor (2019), it is important to be fair in human life. Because issues such as individual happiness, awareness of rights, social life, tolerance, level of development and protection of personal rights are valued together with the value of fairness. As a matter of fact, Yildirim (2011) found in his study that students care about social justice and generally consider it within the scope of equality of opportunity and rights. In this study, teachers may have pointed out that every student has equal rights and that all students' rights are protected. In the findings of the research, it is seen that the value of affection is as important as the value of fairness. Affection is the common feeling of people. In this sense, a person full of affection is respectful, tolerant and happy (Kiliç, 2019). After all, it can be said that affection is the basic element of being human. For this reason, it is thought that it is important to keep affection alive in inclusive classes.

Research findings reveal that self-confidence is seen as another important value in inclusive classes. According to Aşılıoğlu (2019), self-confidence means being satisfied with being oneself and living in peace with himself and his environment as a result. For this reason, self-confidence is known as a factor affecting learning. In addition, high or low self-confidence affects the behavior and emotions of the individuals (Soner, 2000). Therefore, with self-confident students can be effective in achieving the purpose of inclusive education. Likewise, self-esteem is seen as important in inclusive classes. The high self-esteem of individuals enables them to adapt to the society they live in and to be an active member of the society. In addition, high self-esteem positively affects individuals' thoughts, behaviors and moods. It brings them happiness and success in their lives. Self-esteem has an effect on the development of a healthy personality, self-expression, self-reliance and life satisfaction. Individuals with low self-esteem, on the other hand, may have problems in adapting to social relationships, accepting themselves as they are, and in friendships (Atlay, 2019; Bulut, 2016). In addition, social life skills develop thanks to sharing among students, integration with society increases thanks to interaction, and thus both socialization and self-esteem of students increase (Metin, 2018; Staub, Peck, Gallucci, & Schwartz 2000).

It is important for classroom management to be tolerance of teachers and students in inclusive education. Having equal rights for every individual requires being flexible and tolerance to all students (Akalin, 2015; Sucuoğlu & Kargin, 2006; Sahin, 2010). In the findings of this study, teachers drew attention to the value of tolerance. This shows that the value of tolerance is valued by teachers and seen as an important value for inclusive classes. As a matter of fact, it is stated in the literature that respect and tolerance for differences among students are indispensable for life (Madden & Slavin, 1983; Metin, 2012, Sahin, 2010).

Research findings show that sharing, solidarity and cooperation values are important in inclusive classes. This situation is consistent with the results of the researches in the literature. As a matter of fact, it is important for the child to receive help from his peers in terms of self-esteem,

attitude towards school and social acceptance (Calhoon & Fuchs, 2003; Esmer, Yilmaz, Gunes, Tarim & Delican, 2017; Karaca, 2018, Metin, 2018; Snell & Janney, 2000) .

The findings of the study indicate that teachers mostly have an expectation of behavior from students who do not have special needs in inclusive classes. It may suggest that teachers generally attach importance to teach values to these students in inclusive classrooms. The most frequently cited value for the students with no special education is empathy. In fact, empathy is one of the most necessary elements in achieving effective inclusive education. Empathy is the ability to understand the emotional state of other people and react emotionally accordingly, and empathy prevents the emergence of interpersonal communication problems and minimizes conflicts (Piskin, 1994). Previous findings on empathy inclusive education indicate that empathy prevents some undesired feelings and behaviors such as selfishness, oppression, not listening to the other, rejecting the other, lack of communication and developing negative emotions (Bahar, 2018; Dokmen, 2005).

While the teachers talked about the behaviors expected from students without special needs, they also emphasized the behaviors expected from students with no special needs. This situation can be considered as teachers' holistic approach to inclusive education and their emphasis on the roles of students without special needs in inclusive education. This approach is important for the success of inclusive education. In fact inclusive education is an approach which aims at making students aware of the differences among them and be respectful to their friends (Salend, 1998). In addition, this approach was developed to meet the needs of all students (Ferguson, 1996). Based on the conclusions of the study it appears that in order for the students with special needs to gain values, all students in inclusive classrooms must have acquired these values and all students in the school must have transformed these values into behavior as a whole.

In the study it is found that the participants mostly employ individual study in value education in the context of inclusive education. They are found to less use lectures and question-answer pairs for this purpose. This finding reminds us the significance of the individualized education programs (IEPs) in inclusive education. Because in order to meet the needs of students with special needs in inclusive classes, plans are prepared based on the individual differences among the students (Martin, Van Dycke, Christensen-Greene, Gardner & Lovett, 2006). Fiscus and Mandell (2002) argue that the IEPs are required to meet the needs of students with special education needs. Although the participants of the study did not mention the IEPs, they reported that they employed some individual study techniques such as assigning homework, assigning tasks, practices, learning by doing, using visuals, drawing pictures or writing poems or essays about the topic, repetition and using technology. However, the question is whether the individual working methods and techniques used by the teachers were employed in line with the IEPs which were specifically prepared for students with special needs. Because the main purpose of the IEPs is to provide students with special needs the educational opportunities that they can utilize at the highest level (Vuran, 2007).

## REFERENCES

- Acarlar, F. (2016). Inclusive model and characteristics of children with special needs. In *Preschool Inclusion in the What, When, Where, Why, How, Who?*, edited by Sucuoglu, B. and Bakkaloglu H., 21-76. Ankara: K k Publishing.
- Akalin, S. (2015). Inclusion Class Teachers' Views and Requirements on Classroom Management. *Ankara University Faculty of Educational Sciences Special Education Journal*, 16 (3), 215-234
- Aktepe, V. (2019). Character and Value Education. In V. Aktepe & M. Gunduz (Eds.), *Teacher as a role model in character and value education* (p.p. 297-324). Ankara: Pegem Akademi Publishing, Ankara.

- Aktepe, V., & Gunduz, M. (2019). Special teaching methods. In V. Aktepe & A. Uzunoç (Eds.), *Values education* (p.p. 71-103). Ankara: Pegem Akademi Publishing.
- Allen, K. E., Cowdery, G. E., Paasche, C. L., Langford, R., Nolan, K., & Cipparrone, B. (2015). *Inclusion in early childhood programs: children with exceptionalities*. New Zealand: Nelson College.
- Aşılıođlu, H. (2019). *Determination of teachers 'and pre-service teachers' self-confidence in technological pedagogical content knowledge and self-efficacy towards computer use*. (Master's Thesis), Gazi University Institute of Educational Sciences, Ankara.
- Atlay, E. (2019). *Investigation of level of secure attachment to parents and self-esteem of primary school 4th grade students*. (Master's Thesis), Gazi University Institute of Educational Sciences, Ankara.
- Bahar, M. (2018). *Examining the empathic tendencies of the classes with inclusive students* (Master thesis). Kırşehir Ahi Evran University Institute of Social Sciences Üniversitesi, Kırşehir.
- Block, M. E., & Obruşnikova, I. (2010). What is inclusion? In Martin E. Block (Eds.), *A teacher's guide to including students with disabilities in general physical education*, (p.p. 15-29). USA, Maryland: Paul H. Brookes Publishing.
- Bulut, H. (2016). *The effect of social skills training on the self-esteem levels of primary school 3rd grade students: Kilis example*. (Master's Thesis), Gazi University Institute of Educational Sciences, Ankara.
- Calhoon, M. B., & Fuchs, L. (2003). The effects of peer-assisted learning strategies and curriculum-based measurement on the mathematics performance of secondary students with disabilities. *Remedial & Special Education*, 24 (4), 235-245.
- Campbell, J., Gilmore, L., & Cuskell, M. (2003). Changing student teachers' attitudes towards Disability and inclusion. *Journal of Intellectual & Developmental Disability*, 28(4): 369-379. doi:10.1080/13668250310001616407
- Dokmen, Ü. (2005). *Communication conflicts and empathy in art and daily life*. Sistem Publishing, İstanbul.
- Esmer, B., Yılmaz, E., Guneş, A.M., Tarım, K., & Delican, B. (2017). Classroom teachers' experiences related to the education of inclusive students. *The Journal Kastamonu Education*, 25 (4): 1601-1618.
- Ferguson, D. L. (1996). Is it inclusion yet? Bursting the bubbles. In *Creating tomorrow's schools today: Stories of inclusion, change and renewal*, edited by M. S. Berres, D. L. Ferguson, P. Knoblock, and C. Woods, 16- 37. New York: Teachers College Press.
- Fiscus, D. E., & Mandell, J. C. (2002). *Bireyselleştirilmiş eğitim programlarının geliştirilmesi* (G. Akçamete, H. G. Şenel ve E. Tekin, Translation.). Ankara: Anı Yayıncılık. (Publication date of the original book 1983)
- Frankel, E. B. (2004). Supporting inclusive care and education for young children with special needs and their families an international perspective. *Childhood Education*, 80(6): 310-316. doi:10.1080/00094056.2004.10521277
- Gresham, F. M. (1986). Conceptual and definitional issues in the assessment of children's social skills: Implications for classifications and training. *Journal of Clinical Child Psychology*, 15(1): 3-15.

- Guralnick, M. (1990). Social competence and early intervention. *Journal of Early Intervention, 14*, 3-14.
- Gurgor, M. (2019). *The role of the series resurrection Ertugrul in gaining the value of justice in the social studies curriculum*. (Master's Thesis), Gazi University Institute of Educational Sciences, Ankara.
- Hayward, A. (2006). *Making Inclusion Happen: A Practical Guide*. Paul Chapman Publishing: London
- Kabasakal, Z., Girli, A., Okun, B., Celik, N., & Vardarli, G. (2008). Inclusive students, peer relationships and peer abuse. *The Journal of Dokuz Eylul University Buca Education Faculty, 23*, 169-176
- Kalambouka, A., Farrell, P., Dyson, A., & Kaplan, I. (2005). *The impact of population inclusivity in schools on student outcomes*. In Research Evidence in Education Library. London: EPPI-Centre, Social Science Research Unit, Institute of Education, University of London.
- Karaca, M.A. (2018). *The effect of inclusive education program on teachers' professional competencies in mainstreaming practices*. (Master Thesis), Necmettin Erbakan University Institute of Educational Sciences, Konya.
- Kiliç, A. (2019). *Primary school fourth grade students' perceptions of love value*. (Master's Thesis) Recep Tayyip Erdogan University Institute of Social Sciences, Rize.
- Kozleski, E., Artiles, A. J. B., & Waitoller, F. R. (2011). *Introduction: equity in inclusive education: historical trajectories and theoretical commitments*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Loreman, T., Deppeler, J., & Harvey, D. (2011). *Inclusive education: supporting diversity in the classroom*. CrowsNest, Australia: Allen&Unwin.
- Madden, N., & Slavin, R. (1983). Mainstreaming students with mild handicaps: Academic and social outcomes. *Review of Educational Research, 53*, 519-659.
- Martin, J. E., Van Dycke, J. L., Christensen, W. R., Greene, B. A., Gardner, J. E., & Lovett, D. L. (2006). Increasing student participation in IEP meetings: Establishing the self-directed IEP as an evidenced-based practice. *Exceptional Children, 72*(3): 299-316. doi:10.1177/001440290607200303
- Metin, N. (2012). Integration of children with special needs N. Text (Ed.) In Special Needs Children, Ankara: Maya Academy Publishing
- Metin, N. (2018). Teacher in preschool inclusive class. *Early Childhood Studies Journal, 5th International Preschool Education Congress Special Issue, 2*, 2,428-439.
- Ministry of National Education. (2005). *Primary school social studies course (grades 4 and 5) Curriculum and Guide*. State Books Directorate: Ankara
- Ministry of National Education. (2015a). *Ministry of National Education Board of Education and Discipline, Life Science Lesson (1, 2 and 3. classes) Curriculum*. Ankara.
- Ministry of National Education. (2018a). *Ministry of National Education Life Science Lesson Education Program (Primary School 1,2 and 3 classes)*.Ankara.

- Ministry of National Education. (2015b). *Ministry of National Education Board of Education and Discipline, Social Studies Lesson 4, 5, 6 and 7th Grades Curriculum*. Ankara.
- Ministry of National Education. (2018b). *Ministry of National Education Social Studies Course Curriculum (Primary and Secondary School 4, 5, 6 and 7 classes)*. Ankara.
- Ministry of National Education. (2019). National education statistics formal education 2018-2019. Strategy Development Directorate of the Ministry of National Education: Ankara.
- Mitchell, D. (2005). *Contextualizing inclusive education*. London: Routledge.
- Myles, B. (2003). *Overview of Asperger Syndrome*. In *Social skills training*, edited by J. E. Baker. 9-17. KS: Autism Asperger Publishing Company.
- Ozmen, R. G. (2009). Creation and presentation of schematic organizers for students with learning disabilities and affected by mental disability in teaching life science, social studies and science, *Journal of National Education*, 181, 289-301.
- Ozpolat, A. (2009). 2005 social studies curriculum in terms of socialization goals.. *Journal of National Education*, 182, 249-267.
- Patton, M. Q. (2014). *Qualitative study and evaluation methods* (M. Bütün & S. B. Demir, Translation .). Ankara: Pegem Publishing. (Publication date of the original book 1990).
- Piskin, F. B. (1994). The relationship between empathy, anxiety and conflict tendency. *Journal of Ankara University Faculty of Educational Sciences*, 22(2): 775-784.
- Sahin, A. (2010). *Examination of the problems faced by students who receive education through inclusion in the socialization process according to the opinions of teachers (Erzurum province example)*. (Master Thesis), Atatürk University Institute of Social Sciences, Erzurum.
- Salend, S. J. (1998). *Effective mainstreaming creating inclusive classrooms*. New York: Merrill, Prentice Hall.
- Slee, R. (2011). *Their regular school: Exclusion, schooling and inclusive education*. London: Routledge.
- Smith, P. (2010) . *Whatever happened to inclusion? The place of students with intellectual disabilities in general education classrooms*. New York: Peter Lang.
- Snell, M. E.,& Janney, R. (2000). *Teachers' guides to inclusive practices: Social relationships and peer support*. Baltimore: Paul H. Brookes Publishing Co.
- Soner, O. (2000). Relationships between family cohesion, student self-confidence and academic achievement. *Marmara University Atatürk Faculty of Education Journal of Trend Sciences*, 12, 249-260.
- Staub, D., Peck, C.A., Gallucci, C. & Schwartz, I. (2000). Peer relationships. In E.M. Snell, & F. Brown (Eds). *Instruction of Students with Severe Disabilities*. PrenticeHall, Inc.
- Sucuoglu, B. & Kargin, T (2006). *Mainstreaming practices in primary education*. Ankara: Morpa.
- Topping, K. (2012). Conceptions of inclusion: widening ideas. In *What Works in Inclusion?*, edited by C. Boyle and K. Topping, 9-18. Maidenhead: Open University Press

Turkish Dictionary. (2011). *Turkish language institution publications* (11th edition). Ankara.

UNESCO.2005. *Guidelines for Inclusion: Ensuring access to education for all*: Paris: UNES.

Vuran, S. (2007). Individualized education programs. In O, Gursel (Ed.), *Development of individualized education programs*, (p.p. 1-10). Eskişehir: Anadolu University Publishing.

Wang, H. L. (2009). Should all students with special educational needs (SEN) be included in mainstraem education provision? A critical analysis. *International Education Studies*, 2(4): 154-161.

Yildirim, F. (2011). *What does university youth understand from social justice? A trendsetting research in the context of social justice principles*. (Doctorate Thesis). Ankara University Institute of Science and Technology, Ankara.

Yildirim, A., & Simsek H. (2018). *Qualitative research methods in the social sciences*. Ankara: Seçkin Publishing.

Zirpoli, J. T., & Melloy, K. J. (1997). *Behavior management: Application for teachers*. Ohio: Merrill PrenticeHall.